Effectiveness of the Whole-of-Government Approach in Overcoming Cross-Sectoral Problems in Makassar City

Novayanti Sopia Rukmana 1*, Saddam Husain Tamrin 2
1* Public Administration Science Universitas Negeri Makassar
Email: novayanti@unm.ac.id
2 Government Science Study Program Universitas Terbuka
Email: saddam-husain@ecampus.ut.ac.id

ABSTRACT

The aim of this research is to evaluate the effectiveness of the Whole-of-Government (WoG) approach in overcoming cross-sectoral problems in Makassar City as well as identify the challenges faced and provide policy recommendations to improve public sector collaboration. The research method used is a literature review, which allows the collection and analysis of various relevant and reliable literature sources. Literature was collected through academic databases such as Google Scholar, JSTOR, and PubMed. The analysis technique used is thematic analysis, where relevant information is grouped into themes that have been identified and synthesized to form a complete picture of WoG effectiveness. The research results show that the main challenges in cross-sector coordination in Makassar City include sectoral egos, lack of effective coordination mechanisms, communication barriers, and lack of resources and capacity. To increase the effectiveness of WoG, this research recommends building a collaborative work culture, developing formal and structured coordination mechanisms, improving communication systems, adequate resource allocation, policy synchronization, and implementing reward systems. It is hoped that the implementation of these recommendations can increase the effectiveness of implementing WoG in overcoming cross-sectoral problems in Makassar City, so that public services can run more optimally and efficiently.

Keywords: Whole-of-Government, cross-sector coordination, public policy, public sector collaboration

INTRODUCTION

In public administration studies, there are various theories and models that focus on improving coordination between institutions and policy integration, which is in line with the principles of Whole of Governance (WoG) (Hidayat, 2007; Nugraha et al., 2023; Rusli, 2016). WoG seeks to overcome these sectoral limitations by promoting synergies between government agencies. This approach involves developing policies and implementing programs in an integrated manner, with the ultimate goal of improving the quality of public services and government efficiency. In the context of public administration, WoG is relevant because it is able to overcome sectoral egos and encourage the creation of better governance that is responsive to community needs (Achmadi & Hariadi, nd; Gafar, 2018). The WoG concept also includes the principles of collaborative management and strategic coordination, which are an important part of modern public administration studies (Christensen & Lægreid, 2006, 2007; Kularathne, 2017). This emphasizes the importance of effective interaction and cooperation between various government units, as well as between government, the private sector and civil society, to achieve larger and more complex goals. The Whole-of-Government (WoG) approach is an approach that prioritizes coordination and collaboration between various sectors and government agencies to achieve...
common goals (Othman & Razali, 2018; Strickland & Miller, 2023). This approach emerged as a response to the complexity of government problems that cannot be solved by one sector alone. Issues such as public health, food security, and security are often cross-sectoral, requiring close collaboration between various government departments and agencies.

The WoG approach first gained global attention in the late 20th and early 21st centuries when developed countries began to face complex and interconnected new challenges. Countries such as Australia, Canada, and the United Kingdom are starting to adopt this approach to address various governance problems that cannot be solved by traditional sectoral approaches. In this context, WoG not only involves coordination within the central government, but also between the central government and regional governments, as well as with the private sector and civil society (Achmadi & Hariadi, nd). WoG emphasizes the importance of integrating policies, programs, and services. In this way, various government agencies no longer work in silos, but collaborate systematically to achieve more effective and efficient results. This approach is expected to reduce sectoral egos, which are often the main obstacle in solving cross-sectoral problems. Cross-sectoral problems often become the main obstacle in the implementation of government and public services in many cities in Indonesia, including Makassar City. Sectoral ego, where each agency or sector tends to work separately and lacks coordination with each other, resulting in inefficiency, duplication of work, and less than optimal service to the community (Haryanto, 2021; Thoha, 2007). This situation demands a new, more holistic and integrated approach in managing government and public services.

The Whole-of-Government (WoG) approach offers a solution to overcome sectoral egos by encouraging collaboration and coordination between various government sectors. WoG is an approach in which various government agencies work together in an integrated manner to achieve the same goals, share information, and coordinate policies and programs (Christensen & Lægreid, 2007; Kularathne, 2017). This approach has been implemented in various countries and has shown positive results in increasing the efficiency and effectiveness of public services. In Indonesia, several regions have begun to adopt this approach. For example, the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government has implemented WoG in various programs and shown encouraging results in terms of increasing the efficiency of public services (Achmadi & Hariadi, nd). A study by (Suryana, 2018) also shows that implementing WoG, especially when combined with e-government, can speed up the public service process and reduce bureaucracy. Apart from that, (Hibatullah, 2023) highlighted the successful implementation of WoG in the Batang Regency Public Service Mall which was able to increase accessibility and public satisfaction with government services.

However, the implementation of WoG in Makassar City still requires further research to evaluate its effectiveness in the local context and identify factors that support and hinder its implementation. Makassar City, as one of the big cities in Indonesia, faces various complex problems that require cross-sectoral solutions. Thus, this research aims to examine the effectiveness of the WoG approach in overcoming cross-sectoral problems in Makassar City, identify existing challenges, and provide policy recommendations to improve public sector collaboration. It is hoped that this research can make an important contribution in efforts to improve the effectiveness of government and public services in Makassar City through implementing the WoG approach. Apart from that, it is hoped that the results of this research can become a reference for other regions facing similar problems, so that they can encourage wider implementation of the WoG approach in Indonesia.
METHOD

This research uses a literature review approach to explore and understand in depth the effectiveness of the Whole-of-Government (WoG) approach in overcoming cross-sectoral problems in Makassar City. This approach was chosen because it allows researchers to collect and analyze various relevant and reliable literature sources, thereby providing comprehensive insight into the topic under study. The literature review was carried out by identifying, evaluating and integrating various sources of information relevant to the implementation of WoG. These sources include books, academic journals, research reports, policy documents, and published scientific articles. The literature review process begins with collecting relevant literature through searches in academic databases such as Google Scholar, JSTOR, and PubMed. After the literature is collected, an evaluation process is carried out to assess the quality and relevance of each source. The selected literature was then analyzed using thematic analysis techniques to identify patterns, themes and categories that emerged from the data. The analysis stages include identifying main themes related to WoG implementation, challenges faced, and effectiveness of cross-sectoral collaboration; grouping relevant information into identified themes; and synthesis of information from multiple sources to form a more complete picture of WoG effectiveness.

To ensure the validity and reliability of the findings, this research also carried out triangulation by comparing information from various sources and checking the consistency of the findings. With this literature review method, the research is expected to provide a comprehensive and in-depth picture of the effectiveness of the Whole-of-Government approach in overcoming cross-sectoral problems in Makassar City. Through comprehensive literature analysis, this research will identify best practices, challenges faced, and provide relevant policy recommendations to improve public sector collaboration in Makassar City.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

An explanation of the causes of the emergence of sectoral ego provides a clearer context for the challenges faced in efforts to improve cross-sector coordination in Makassar City. Understanding these factors is an important step in formulating effective strategies and recommendations to address these problems. This research reveals various challenges and problems in cross-sector coordination in Makassar City. Based on the results of the literature review carried out, several main issues identified include sectoral ego, lack of effective coordination mechanisms, communication barriers, lack of resources and capacity, and unsynchronized regulations and policies.

A. Challenges in Cross-Sector Interaction and Coordination

One of the biggest challenges is sectoral ego, namely the tendency of each sector or agency to work separately and prioritize their own interests without considering the need to collaborate with other sectors (Hibatullah, 2023). The Head of the Makassar City Health Service revealed that it was often difficult to get other agencies to collaborate because they were more focused on their respective targets and programs, which resulted in coordination being ineffective. This sectoral ego causes overlapping programs and inefficiencies in the implementation of public policies. For example, health programs that should be supported by the education and public...
works sectors often run alone without adequate integration. Apart from sectoral ego, the lack of an effective coordination mechanism is also a significant obstacle (Suryana, 2018; Thoha, 2007). It is further explained that even though there are forums or coordination meetings, the results of these meetings are often not followed up properly because there is no strong mechanism for ensure that decisions taken are actually implemented. The lack of this mechanism results in jointly planned policies not being implemented properly, hampering the achievement of larger joint goals.

Communication barriers between sectors are also a major problem. These communication barriers not only slow down the coordination process but can also lead to greater conflict and misunderstanding between sectors. Apart from that, another factor that also influences is the lack of resources and capacity as a challenge in implementing WoG (Christensen & Lægreid, 2006, 2007; Kularathne, 2017). Sometimes, differences in regulations and policies between agencies also become obstacles to coordination. Academics from local universities stated that the policies issued are often out of sync, such as environmental policies which may conflict with infrastructure development policies, making it difficult to reach agreement and coordination. In line with Network theory. This theory emphasizes the importance of relationships and interactions between various actors in a network to achieve common goals (Adam & Kriesi, 2019; Jones et al., 1997; Purbasari et al., 2020). In the WoG context, the formation of cross-sectoral working teams with clear mandates and objectives reflects the importance of an effective network structure to ensure good coordination and continuous communication. Several factors that often cause the emergence of sectoral ego include:

1. Differences in Vision and Mission Between Services
   Each government agency or sector usually has a specific vision, mission and goals according to the area of work of each agency. These differences often make each agency focus more on achieving its own targets, thereby ignoring the importance of cross-sectoral collaboration. For example, the Department of Health may be more focused on public health programs, while the Department of Public Works is more oriented towards infrastructure development, which could lead to conflicting priorities.

2. Silo Organizational Structure
   A silo government organizational structure, where each department operates separately with clear boundaries, also strengthens sectoral egos. This structure tends to limit interaction and communication between agencies, thereby hampering coordination and collaboration efforts. Each agency has different standard operational procedures, reporting systems and work cultures, which can make it difficult to align activities. This is in line with Organizational Culture Theory which emphasizes that the values and norms in an organization influence the behavior and interactions of organizational members (Ertosun & Adiguzel, 2018; Jones et al., 1997; Purbasari et al., 2020). In WoG, cultivating collaborative work includes promoting cooperative values, respecting the contributions of each sector, and encouraging attitudes of mutual trust and respect, all of which contribute to better and more efficient collaboration.

3. Inter-Service Competition
   Competition for budgets and resources often fuels sectoral egos. Each agency tries to show their best performance to get a larger budget allocation. This situation encourages agencies to work independently and are reluctant to share information or resources with other agencies, because it is thought to reduce their competitiveness.
4. Lack of Understanding of the Benefits of Collaboration
   Many officials and staff in various agencies may not fully understand the benefits of cross-sector collaboration. This lack of understanding results in resistance to collaborative efforts, as they are deemed to provide no direct benefit to their own services. In fact, good collaboration can increase the efficiency and effectiveness of the programs being implemented.

5. Isolated Work Culture
   The work culture that has been formed over the years within each service is often isolated. The habit of working independently and focusing on internal tasks makes officials and staff less open to collaborative ideas and synergies with other agencies. This culture is difficult to change without strong intervention from leadership and policies that encourage cross-sector collaboration.

6. Unsupportive Policies and Regulations
   Some current policies and regulations may not support or even hinder cross-sectoral collaboration. Policies that are not synchronized between agencies, complicated bureaucratic procedures, and conflicting regulations can be significant obstacles in efforts to integrate cross-sector programs and activities.

Understanding these factors is an important step in formulating effective strategies and recommendations to address these problems. This research reveals various challenges and problems in cross-sector coordination in Makassar City. From the Literature Review carried out, several main issues identified include sectoral egos, lack of effective coordination mechanisms, communication barriers, lack of resources and capacity, and unsynchronized regulations and policies. One of the biggest challenges is sectoral ego, namely the tendency of each sector or agency to work separately and prioritize their own interests without considering the need to collaborate with other sectors. This sectoral ego causes overlapping programs and inefficiencies in the implementation of public policies. For example, health programs that should be supported by the education and public works sectors often run alone without adequate integration.

Apart from sectoral egos, the lack of effective coordination mechanisms is also a significant obstacle. Senior staff at the Regional Development Planning Agency (Bappeda) stated that even though there are forums or coordination meetings, the results of these meetings are often not followed up properly because there is no strong mechanism to ensure that the decisions taken are actually implemented. The lack of this mechanism results in jointly planned policies not being implemented properly, hampering the achievement of larger joint goals.

B. **Policy recommendations to improve public sector collaboration.**

The results of this research indicate that to increase the effectiveness of the Whole-of-Government approach in Makassar City, efforts are needed to overcome sectoral egos, strengthen coordination mechanisms, and improve communication between sectors. Some recommendations that can be considered include building a more collaborative work culture through training and workshops that emphasize the importance of cross-sector cooperation, developing more formal and structured coordination mechanisms such as establishing a cross-sector coordination team with a clear mandate, implementing a more effective communication system, with mutually agreed standard terminology and procedures, allocating sufficient resources to support cross-sectoral programs, and synchronizing policies between agencies through regular policy evaluations to ensure harmony and avoid regulatory conflicts. By implementing these
recommendations, it is hoped that it can increase the effectiveness of Whole-of-Government implementation in overcoming cross-sectoral problems in Makassar City, so that public services can run more optimally and efficiently.

One of the biggest challenges is sectoral ego, namely the tendency of each sector or agency to work separately and prioritize their own interests without considering the need to collaborate with other sectors. Another problem is that it is often difficult to get other agencies to collaborate because each agency is more focused on its own targets and programs, which results in ineffective coordination. This sectoral ego causes overlapping programs and inefficiencies in the implementation of public policies. For example, health programs that should be supported by the education and public works sectors often run alone without adequate integration.

Apart from sectoral egos, the lack of effective coordination mechanisms is also a significant obstacle. Senior staff at the Regional Development Planning Agency (Bappeda) stated that even though there are forums or coordination meetings, the results of these meetings are often not followed up properly because there is no strong mechanism to ensure that the decisions taken are actually implemented. The lack of this mechanism results in jointly planned policies not being implemented properly, hampering the achievement of larger joint goals. Communication barriers between sectors are also a major problem.

Differences in regulations and policies between agencies also hinder coordination. Academics from local universities stated that the policies issued are often out of sync, such as environmental policies which may conflict with infrastructure development policies, making it difficult to reach agreement and coordination. The results of this research indicate that to increase the effectiveness of the Whole-of-Government approach in Makassar City, efforts are needed to overcome sectoral egos, strengthen coordination mechanisms, and improve communication between sectors. Some policy recommendations that can be considered include:

1. Building a Collaborative Work Culture: Training and workshops that emphasize the importance of cross-sector collaboration can help build a more collaborative work culture.
2. Developing Formal and Structured Coordination Mechanisms: Establishing cross-sector coordination teams with clear mandates and standard operating procedures can help strengthen coordination mechanisms. This includes establishing key performance indicators that measure the effectiveness of collaboration between agencies.
3. Improving Communication Systems: Implementing more effective communication systems with mutually agreed standard terminology and procedures can reduce miscommunication.
4. Allocating Adequate Resources: Allocating sufficient budget and resources to support cross-sectoral programs is essential.
5. Synchronizing Policies: Conducting regular policy evaluations to ensure harmony and avoid regulatory conflicts between agencies.
6. Implement a Reward System. Giving awards to agencies or individuals who successfully demonstrate good collaborative performance can motivate other agencies to do the same.

In order to increase the effectiveness of the Whole-of-Government approach in Makassar City, strategic steps are needed to overcome existing cross-sector coordination challenges. Differences in regulations and policies between agencies, which are often out of sync, have hampered effective collaboration. Therefore, building a collaborative work culture through training and workshops, as well as developing formal and structured coordination mechanisms,
are important steps that need to be taken. In addition, improving the communication system to mutually agreed standards, adequate resource allocation, and regular policy synchronization, will greatly help in strengthening coordination between agencies. Implementing a reward system for collaborative performance can also motivate other agencies to actively participate in cross-sector collaboration. By adopting these recommendations, Makassar City can overcome sectoral egos and achieve higher effectiveness in implementing the Whole-of-Government approach, so as to provide better and more comprehensive public services to the community.

CONCLUSION

This research highlights the importance of the Whole-of-Government (WoG) approach to addressing cross-sectoral problems in Makassar City. Sectoral ego, caused by differences in vision and mission between agencies, siled organizational structures, and a lack of understanding of the benefits of collaboration, is the main obstacle in coordination between sectors. The research results show that sectoral ego causes inefficiency and duplication of work. Additionally, lack of effective coordination mechanisms, communication barriers, and limited resources exacerbate the situation. To overcome this challenge, policy recommendations include building a collaborative work culture, developing formal coordination mechanisms, improving communication systems, allocating adequate resources, synchronizing policies, and implementing reward systems. The WoG approach is seen as an effective solution to improve cross-sectoral coordination and public services in Makassar City, with the hope of optimizing government efficiency and effectiveness. The effectiveness of the Whole-of-Government (WoG) approach in overcoming cross-sectoral problems in Makassar City. First, systematic efforts need to be made to build a more collaborative work culture in all government departments and agencies. This can be realized through training, workshops and capacity development programs that emphasize the importance of cross-sector collaboration. Second, the Makassar City government needs to develop a more formal and structured coordination mechanism, such as the formation of a cross-sector coordination team with a clear mandate and standard operational procedures. Third, improving the communication system between agencies is very important to reduce miscommunication and increase efficiency. The use of integrated information technology can be an effective solution in this case. Fourth, adequate resource allocation, both in terms of budget and staff, must be prioritized to support cross-sectoral programs. Finally, synchronization of policies between agencies needs to be carried out periodically to ensure harmony and avoid regulatory conflicts. Implementing a reward system for agencies or individuals who demonstrate good collaborative performance can also motivate increased cross-sector collaboration. By adopting these suggestions, it is hoped that Makassar City can increase the effectiveness of implementing the WoG approach and provide more optimal and efficient public services.

REFERENCES


