#### Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Administrasi Publik: Jurnal Pemikiran dan Penelitian Administrasi Publik

Volume 13 Number 1, January – June 2023. Page 103-114

p-ISSN: 2086-6364, e-ISSN: 2549-7499 Homepage: http://ojs.unm.ac.id/iap

## Democratic Public Service (Case of License Operating Billboards in Makassar City)

# Nani Harlinda Nurdin<sup>1</sup>, Zulkarnain Hamson<sup>2</sup>, Muhammad Nasir Mahmud<sup>3</sup>, Nining Haslinda Zainal<sup>4</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> Department of Public Administration, Universitas Indonesia Timur, Indonesia
  - <sup>2</sup> Department of Communication, Universitas Indonesia Timur, Indonesia
    - <sup>3</sup> Department of Government, Universitas Indonesia Timur, Indonesia
  - <sup>4</sup> Department of Public Administration, Universitas Bosowa, Indonesia Email: naniharlinda69@gmail.com

#### **ABSTRACT**

One of the points of concern in public administration is the organising of democratic public services. Democratic public service is the basic essence in realizing justice and social welfare. This can be realized if it involves all state stakeholders and domains in the administration of the government. In this perspective, public services should obtain genuine attention, be processed professionally and properly provided to residents of service users. Billboard licence is one of the types of licensing services issued by the government along with the rapid growth of companies or industries that have an impact on the increase in regional revenue. In addition to increasing regional revenue, the increase in billboards is directly proportional to various violations that occur because of services provided so that they are important to be handled. The purpose of this study is to evaluate the degree to which the Regional Revenue Agency of Makassar City, one of the government organisers in public services, organises democratic public services, particularly in the execution of billboards. The study employs a qualitative method and includes both primary and secondary data. Through in-depth interviews and observation, primary data is gathered. secondary information obtained from documents. Data reduction is then used to process the acquired data. The results of the study show that democratic public services have not been implemented. Complexity, bureaucracy, apparatus performance and community attitudes towards public services are factors that influence service integrity.

**Keywords:** Democratic Public Service,; Three Pillars Institutional; Billboard Licensing

#### **INTRODUCTION**

One point of attention in administration public is maintenance services and policies democratic public (Harlinda, 2019). This Already becomes not quite enough the state is handling citizens for the welfare of the people (Sahuri, 2019). The role of this state is organised by the government through the bureaucracy as an implementation instrument of public service and public policy proper with wants and needs of the public (Gawthrop, 2002). Interest's citizens to be based in maintenance service must be put forward. Organiser public service need more "heard the listening" of residents rather than "dictating telling" and providing "service-serving" rather than "directing-steering". Citizens and officials publicly expected Work together to decide and resolve problems together in some way in a cooperative and profitable second split party (Denhardt & Denhardt, 2007).

Administration public service and policy that public democratic is one perspective administration growing public moment this namely public governance. Perspective This try understanding interest public from side involvement public through interaction whole stakeholders' interests (Alwi, A.Aslinda, 2019). Interaction from whole stakeholders' interest will possibly accommodate the whole want, need as well as interest of its citizens.

Public service can be interpreted as something which is done by the government to look after all things needed by society (Berenschot, 2019). In context this function of government through apparatus is as a public servant, which means that task apparatus government democratic is something approach used in the era of the New Public Service. In context this orientation public service is the result and is not quite enough inherent responsibility to the government Because concerns fulfil the need base of its citizens. That service should obtain attention and processing professionally as well as be provided with worthy user service.

One form of public service is permission, because people who use the service must pay according to the tariff set by the government (Pratama et al., 2019). Permission or permits which are public service must be in accordance with rules set by the government area as organiser government (Ebhote & Nkebem, 2019). So that what will be implemented be legal/ official and not contrary with provisions that have been set (Rani Wardaniah, 2013). this intended for society to fulfil his needs no disturbing order and convenience.

Permission is one of the most widely used instruments used in law administration. this because government use permission as instrument for influence connection with its citizens so that they will follow way recommended by the government to use reach concrete goals (Asiyah, 2017). In service licensing there is various type licensing including: allows business, permission industry, tax advertisement, permission establish building permit interference and so on. Permission billboards is one type of service permits issued by the government city (A.M. Yadisar, 2018). Along with the faster growth of the company or industry so will increase income in the original area through tax from maintenance billboards because one mix marketing industry is promotions consisting of advertisements, advertisements and promotions sales.

Tax Advertisement as one source Potential Regional Revenue need done collection in a manner efficient, effective and economical so that it can play a more role in business enhancement Regional Original Income, especially in Makassar City (Saqban, 2021). Income original area is income earned from reception tax area, levy area, profit company area, and other legitimate areas (Nurcholis, 2007). Regional Original Income is acceptance received from reception sector tax area, levy area, results company owned by area, results management riches separated areas, and other income original legal area.

Increasing number of billboards in Makassar City, besides the added income area, also compared directly to the more height violations on maintenance advertisements (Gunawan & Syahyadi, 2020). Types violation maintenance advertisements found in Makassar City are among other violations about permission location installation, mounting media infringing advertisement ecology environment, yes party an installer that doesn't pay attention to expiration date permission installation advertisement, so lots posted advertisement without exists confirmation extension installation advertisement. Violation happens for diverse type advertisements. Those wild advertisements plugged in the streets, either road highway or not road highway like on the edge city.

Moment this is advertising media has become one of the profitable and amazing effective marketing alternatives because it can be accessible to all parties, so maintenance permission should be managed well by the government, besides billboards (Tarring, 2022). This is one source

income area that makes billboards as one must pay attention to, either in matters permits, grants rules and rates installation advertisements regulated by law nor regulation area. This is important because many violations that occurred good from operational nor from side income as consequence maintenance less service touch need public as customer.

Because that should bring attention together, this is how the public can be fulfilled in accordance with values democracy. Not quite enough answer democratic government of course life people that is how need public can be fulfilled in following values democracy. Not quite enough to answer democratic government. of course, life people can be rated with ease when the doors source welfare is managed with well by the government through possible access reachable by all parties without there are obstacles and domination in meaning position people in public service is strong no otherwise (Haque, 2001). Based on the matter the Indonesian government has made policy in service reform public, namely (1) Law Number 25 of 2009 concerning Public Service; and (2) Regulation of the Minister of Utilisation State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform Republic of Indonesia Number 15 of 2014 concerning Guidelines Standard Service.

Policy the made with meaning for strengthen commitment government in increase quality public service and build trust public on public service affairs conducted by state administrators. Besides that, a policy that is also intended as an effort to emphasise rights and obligations of every citizen as well realisation not quite enough answer internal state administrators give public service (Rachmawati & Nasution, 2015).

From the description above, in this article try give description about service permission billboards conducted by the Regional Revenue Agency of Makassar City as one of form maintenance public service. So that which can be known as a service permission billboard organised by the Makassar City Regional Revenue Agency apply values and systems democratic public service?

#### **Institutional Theory**

To analyse the democratic public service, this paper uses one of the theories in governance, namely the theory of institutions. It is based on the regulative pillar, normative pillar and cultural-cognitive pillar that can explain the role of stakeholders in realizing democratic public services. Scott says that institutional institutions, which include symbolic components, social activity, and material resources, fall within the category of social structures (Scott, 2014). A collection of procedures having regulative, normative, and cultural-cognitive components that are subject to change need the presence of an institution. Even while the institution's primary components are laws, customs, and cultural advantages, the notion of the institution also includes the linking of actions to material resources. As a result, legitimate legal, procedural, moral, and cultural limits define what an institution is.

### **Democratic Public Service and License Operating Billboards**

Molina and McKeown (in Tutik Rachmawati, 2015) state that a public administrator must ensure that democratic values such as inclusiveness, integrity, transparency, and accountability are applied in his public services as the main tool to encourage people to (a) believe in public organization; and (b) obtaining stakeholder involvement for policies and projects. Molina and McKeown propose that public services in Indonesia need to pay attention to the framework of democratic values such as accountability, honesty, inclusiveness, integrity, social justice, and

transparency. These democratic values need to be considered and become the main in the services provided by public organizations.

Public service is defined as any activity performed by the government on behalf of a large group of people that is helpful to the group or unity and supplies satisfaction even when the outcomes are not directly tied to a tangible good. Kurniawan (Kurniawan T, 2007) claimed to have outlined the definition of public service. In line with the fundamental policies and procedures that have been proved, public service is the supply of goods or services to meet the demands of the public or of those having an interest in the organization.

Licensing services are conducted as an effort to meet the needs of the community, for example the efforts of the authorised agencies in supplying guarantees of legal certainty and the businesses they have so that they can guarantee all activities. Thus, licensing services are all forms of activities conducted by the government to the community that are legal in nature or legalise the ownership, rights, existence and activities of individuals or organizations. There are several principles in the administration of licensing or government services, these principles can supply guidance on the effectiveness, efficiency, and accountability of services (Haerial, 2016).

Meanwhile, the definition of billboards based on Makassar City Regulation Number 3 of 2010 Concerning Regional Taxes Chapter I Article 1 paragraph 17 is: " In order to introduce, encourage, promote, or draw attention to products, services, persons, or entities that the general public may see, read, hear, feel, and/or enjoy, billboards are things, tools, activities, or media whose shapes and qualities are meant for commercial objectives". Therefore, it can be said that the administration of advertisement licences is a form of government activity in meeting the needs of the public related to the dissemination of information to consumers both commercially and non-commercially based on certain rules by needs.

Based on its characteristics, democratic public service always puts forward equality, togetherness and consensus in conducting its activities. So that the main concern in this paper are the organizations and all stakeholders involved in organising the advertisement licence in the Makassar City Revenue Agency, do they have values and systems that promote equality, togetherness, justice and consensus in realizing democratic service goals. Institutional theory is an approach that allows all of these to contribute based on 3 (three) elements, namely the regulative system, normative system and culture cognitive system.

#### **METHOD**

Study This use approach qualitative descriptive, where objective from approach study qualitative This no is generalisation but understanding in a manner deep to something problem (Sugiyono, 2013). Study This done with approach studies case, where writer do exploration (Creswell JW, 2013) of processes and mechanisms service in matter This is For explain Democratic Public Service in implementation permission operational board billboards in the city of Makassar. Data collection was carried out with interviews as well as collecting relevant documentation with problem study both primary data and secondary. Data collection techniques were carried out by analysis techniques deep with study case service permission operational board advertisements in Makassar City using knife analysis from three pillars of the theory institutional (Scott, 2014) in a democratic governance perspective.



Figure 1. Democratic Public Service System

Stage furthermore in deep data analysis technique this study is data reduction with do grouping, simplification as well as separate some data are not needed so that produce a number of convenient information in withdrawal conclusion. Then presentation of data made at the time organises data systematically and easy for understanding in matters in the form of tables and pictures that aim to make it easy to make conclusions. Stage end in analytical technique this study is withdrawal purposeful conclusions look for meaning from some data already collected with method look for good relationship, equation nor difference so that can pull conclusion which is answer from problem or question this study.

#### RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The results showed that the service system conducted by the Makassar City Revenue Agency has not accommodated the values and systems intended for democratic public services, where the principles are openness, compliance, equality, justice and consensus have not been fulfilled.

Table 1. Billboard Licence Service System

	Pillar		
Description	Regulatory Pillar	Normative Pillar	Pillars of Culture- Cognitive
Fundamentals of Compliance	Regional Regulation No. 3 of 2010 concerning Regional Tax	No penalty	Made in a manner unilateral
Mechanism / internal system service licensing	characteristic coercion Because done payment tax especially formerly so that can served	Used in framework enhancement income through tax advertisement, however no walk in a manner equally on customers especially related advertisements field social	Consider need
Transparency Cost	There are Rules	No walk maximum	Socialisation limited
suitability time	There are Rules	No walk maximum	Lack of integrity implementation service

Source; Author Data Reduction, 2022

Table 1 explained that good rules made nor mechanical existing services, no walk so that in accordance with expected goals not yet achieved like Still many existing violations in matter payment tax billboards as source income original area. In fact, there are still lots of user-exempted services in payment of the tax. Whereas service done after the user pays tax especially first. Beside that many posted advertisements in a manner chaotic as consequence no he obeyed zona installation by the executor service, so can said no there is compliance with existing regulations. On transparency less cost socialisation, only obtained at the time comes at the office service, so need additional time. So anyway, with a suitability time settlement document that is not following what was promised at the time management.

#### **Regulatory Pillar**

Scott explained that the regulative pillar works in context rules, in addition to monitoring and sanctions, so matter This is closely related to enforcement rules. As for the way enforcement through formal or non-formal, written mechanisms or not written. Even though this regulatory system works through repression and constraints, it also provides opportunity (empower) against individuals in the institution. In matters regulatory pillar work through restrictions, obviously poured in the rules that have been made as basic members for act. This proved in results research (Table 1) that with there is Regional Regulation Number 3 of 2010 concerning Local Tax means has fulfil dimensions the main regulatory pillars namely exists rules and some lean operational Procedure (SOP) in give service tax advertisement. The nature of the regulative pillars such as relief and repressive is also reflected from service mechanisms and systems. Restrictions and properties repressive shown on occurrence payment tax especially formerly then service can be served. If linked with perspective democratic governance (Ali et al., 2012) where service to public must more takes precedence, in the sense that service especially formerly then payment the tax so that service democratic. Although thus, in a manner regulatory to give a wide range of opportunities for members, even given discretion when One rule will be modified by members if they will. This same match with democratic governance context puts forward an understanding and consensus on some rules. Besides that, it's also in line with criteria of democracy that all members own the same rights to participate in decision institutions about rules as well as policy (Dahl, 2015).

#### **Normative Pillar**

Normative pillars give emphasis on use dimensions prescriptive, evaluative, and obligatory in life social. Normative pillar it's in it there are aspect values and norms. Aspect mark is conception from preference standard recognized behaviour together about good or bad things (Scott, 2014). In literature else, value is something belief personal somebody about what to fought for and how somebody must behave in life social (Robbins & Judge, 2017). In results study these regulative pillars are shown with existing mechanisms used in service licensing billboards aim for enhancement income through tax advertisement. In practice no walk in a manner equally to customers especially related advertisements social field. Still there treated customers in a manner special because proximity and or colleague from the rulers government in Makassar City so released in fulfil mechanism nor payment tax au minimised the payment. Likewise with related

advertisements field the same social very No collected cost so that raises gap discriminatory service.

Temporary That norm is specification How something must resolve. Norm defines a legal way to reach purpose. System normative defines success from an achievement target (Scott, 2014). In literature, the norm is informal rules and beliefs together where a group tries to build behaviour from its members. Norm will influence conformity of individuals in some groups (Robbins & Judge, 2017). This reflected in results research shows not enough it's transparent about financing although Already set the rules, however the amount that has been set sometimes not enforced The same for customers, as well as suitability no time apply uniform to customers. So, this normative pillar is also not walk in a manner maximum. Because in context democratic should apply equal and equal treatment to all customer good rule, fee nor my time settlement.

With thereby a number of values and norms apply for all members of an institution, however some are just apply For individual or position certain. Application values and norms assign status and roles to members of an institution. Values and norms This intended to give objectives and mandates for individuals in accordance with social position (Scott, 2014).

#### **Cognitive Cultural Pillars**

Element cultural-cognitive on an institution emphasises conception together forming characteristic social reality and creating a frame where a meaning is made. In other literature it is said, culture in institutions is recognized by social knowledge together in some institutions about the rules, norms, and values that make up attitude as well as behaviour members (Colquitt, Jason, Jeffeery Lepine, 2014). Element cognitive-cultural on an institution according to Scott (2014) consists of embodied symbols in words, signs, and gestures. Elements will form meaning in objects and activities in institutions. Culture plays an important role, because it gives game rules for institutions (Robbins & Judge, 2017). First, culture's own role to determine the difference between organizations. Second, culture conveys a sense of identity for members. Third, culture eases commitment with bigger than interest. Culture can be formed by the values introduced by the leader in an organization (Boon Siong NEO, 2007).

Studies show that rules used in work service permission billboards along reception tax billboards made in a manner unilaterally, that is just b from element Government, as well as socialisation related very limited financing, so the public doesn't know magnitude cost before they look after permission. Whereas in the cultural-cognitive pillar here are common beliefs namely exists belief together between stakeholders' interest in characteristic policies collaborative. In implementing common beliefs there is a shared logic of action namely exists logic action together.

Embodiment from the share logic of action contained in action shared by the actors policy, where in implementation permits and taxes billboards This No held in accordance with decree ever time used for settlement matter grab. So that no created action based on what has been mutually agreed. This sure is just contrary good in the cultural cognitive pillar as well in democratic governance context. Because democratic governance requires common beliefs and shared logic of action all stakeholders are interested in planning and implementing policy in service to the public. This is important because in order to realise objective democratic public service, it accommodates whole stakeholders with varied interests with complex problems. Democratic governance in relation with a system cultural-cognitive (institution) is something rating system involving my master interest in planning and implementing policy in a manner fair and equitable in aspect social-structural.

Response Description **User Service** executor Service **Restrictions Procedure** Created simple procedure Still their activity that is not based on SOPs according to SOPs Empathy with user service If anything, problem always Although served However searched solution Still must wait Procedure clarification Explain manually is if there is Socialisation procedures service Still not enough service inquiring user Transparency Cost Already set in the tax register Still need socialisation so that public know obligation before management suitability time Can't yet ensure time Needed accuracy time settlement settlement

Table 2. Response User Service

Source: Author Data Reduction, 2022

Table 2 explains that according to user service / public that running mechanism not yet adequate because not yet consider need user service in matter this like Standard Operational System (SOP) is very necessary so that before do management can know what just obligatory obligations fulfilled. Likewise with procedure clarity service that is not socialised with Good as well as suitability no time clear. With known obligatory obligations fulfilled by the user, service can maximise time management so the service process can be more effective and efficient. Effective because time management does not eat a long time in the management process, and efficient because users can reckon costs that will be issued.

From the description the on describe that service has not been carried out by the Makassar City Regional Revenue Agency fulfil characteristics democratic public service. In research this is seen running just the process, in a sense when someone takes care then processed is taxes and allows the advertisement. Appears on payment tax done especially formerly done. So that the first need fulfilled is to need executor service whereas in the dimensions democratic public service, mark main want achieved is need public service. Based on reality in research, we suggest that inside maintenance permission billboards make rules based on the need of the public to put forward equality, openness, agreement together, more transparent and fairer so that democratic public service can materialise (figure 1).

#### **CONCLUSION**

Based on question research and results research, next can pulled conclusion a number of matters for realise democratic public service with adopt three pillars institutional theories in the perspective of democratic governance, as following:

1. Regulative pillars are defined as series provisions, instructions, benchmarks, or orders made by members with an objective for arranging behaviour and interactions actor in an institution

in general is results decision together should adhere to and implemented where attitude tie emphasises what is and is not should done by members in one institution. In research this is seen that rules used are rules that are formulated and proved dominated by the government not yet involved in a manner full of other elements such as society and parties private, so form the rules are executed considered Not yet can be whole public interest.

- 2. Normative pillars provide emphasis on use dimensions prescriptive, evaluative, and obligatory in life social in it there are aspect values and norms aspect mark are conception from preference standard recognized behaviour together about good or bad something. This study show that permit normative system board billboards actually has listed in a manner whole in the mechanism service licensing and SOP as well already going to toward democratic from side values and norms for example that in mark there is conception together like and want with construction standard existing structure there is or behaviour can compared to with mark while at the norm ie own not quite enough responsible and fair, only just Not yet done in a manner maximum.
- 3. Cultural-Cognitive pillar emphasises conception together forming characteristic social reality and creating a frame where a meaning is created which is recognized social knowledge together in some institution about the rules, norms, and values that make up attitude as well as behaviour of its members. In study not yet created with good understanding together and action based on what have agreed together, as shown in the precision of my time as well as magnitude treatment costs not yet equally to the whole customer.

Democratic governance is a series of processes to reach consensus and implement rules, rights, basic human, legal, policy and social structure in pursuit of justice, welfare and protection to realise democratic public service.

#### REFERENCE

- A.M. Yadisar. (2018). Sistem Pelayanan Izin Reklame. Fokus: Publikasi Ilmiah Untuk Mahasiswa, Staf Pengajar Dan Alumni Universitas Kapuas Sintang, 16(1).
- Ali, A., Abrar, M., & Haider, J. (2012). Impact of Motivation on the working performance of employees- A case study of Pakistan. *Global Advanced Research Journal of Management and Business Studies*, 1(4), 191–199.
- Alwi, A.Aslinda, G. S. (2019). View of Cross-Sector Collaboration and Public Policy Accountability\_ Implementation Network of Food Security Policy in Bone Regency.pdf. IAPA. https://journal.iapa.or.id/proceedings/article/view/281/183
- Asiyah, N. (2017). Strategi Implementasi Perizinan Dan Sanksi Administratif Sebagai Pembatasan Terhadap Kebebasan Bertindak. *Jurnal Hukum Samudra Keadilan*, 12(1), 123–135.
- Berenschot, W. (2019). Informal democratization: brokers, access to public services and

- democratic accountability in Indonesia and India. Democratization, 26(2), 208-224. https://doi.org/10.1080/13510347.2018.1512590
- Boon Siong NEO, A. G. C. (2007). DYNAMIC GOVERNANCE Embedding Culture, Capabilities and Change in Singapore. World Scientific Publishing Co. Pte. Ltd.
- Colquitt, Jason, Jeffeery Lepine, M. W. (2014). Organizational Behavior: Essentials for Improving Performance and Commitment. McGraw-Hill Education.
- Creswell JW. (2013). Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches Creswell (*z*-lib.org).pdf 265). Publications. (p. Sage https://id1lib.org/book/3700358/d95149
- Denhardt, J. V., & Denhardt, A. R. B. (2007). New Public Service; Serving Not Steering. In Encyclopedia of Public Administration and Public Policy, Second Edition (Print Version). M.E.Sharpe Armonk, New York. https://doi.org/10.1201/noe1420052756.ch268
- Ebhote, O., & Nkebem, O. J. A. (2019). Service delivery and customer satisfaction in the Nigerian shipping industry. International Journal of Business Forecasting and Marketing Intelligence, 5(4), 450. https://doi.org/10.1504/ijbfmi.2019.105344
- Gawthrop, L. C. (2002). Public Service and Democracy: Ethical Imperatives for the 21st Century (Public Administration and Public Policy). Praeger Publishers.
- Gunawan, G., & Syahyadi, A. I. (2020). Sistem Pengawasan Dan Pengaduan Pemasangan Reklame Dengan Teknologi Mobile. Jusikom: Jurnal Sistem Komputer Musirawas, 5(2), 96–105. https://doi.org/10.32767/jusikom.v5i2.1016
- Haerial. (2016). Kondisi makro ekonomi dalam penguatan pajak daerah pada struktur pendapatan kota makassar. Akmen Jurnal Ilmiah, 13(1), 11–23.
- Haque, A. (2001). GIS, public service, and the issue of democratic governance. Public Administration Review, 61(3), 259–265. https://doi.org/10.1111/0033-3352.00028
- Harlinda, N. (2019). Optimalisasi Pelayanan Publik Dalam Perspektif New Publick Servicepada Badan Pendapatan Daerah Kota Makassar. Jurnal Ilmiah Pranata Edu, 1(1), 1-13. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.36090/jipe.v1i1.188
- Nurcholis, H. (2007). Teori dan Praktik: Pemerintahan dan Otonomi Daerah. Grasindo.
- Pratama, P. E., Kamil, M., & Salahudin, S. (2019). Implementation of the Integrity Zone Development Program towards a Corruption-Free Area and a Serving Clean Bureaucracy Region. **Journal** of Local Government Issues, 2(2),134. https://doi.org/10.22219/logos.vol2.no2.134-148
- Rachmawati, T., & Nasution, S. J. (2015). Nilai Demokrasi dalam Pelayanan Publik: Studi Kasus Kantor Imigrasi Bandung. JKAP (Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Administrasi Publik), 19(2), 133. https://doi.org/10.22146/jkap.8166
- Rani Wardaniah. (2013). Kritik Terhadap Pelayanan Publik Pemerintah Daerah di Indonesia. *Jurnal Adminisrasi Negara Universitas Putra Batam*, 6(1), 1–7.
- Robbins, S. P., & Judge, T. A. (2017). Organizational Behavior. In Fortune. PEARSON C U S T O M LIBRA R Y.

- Sahuri, C. (2019). Membangun Kepercayaan Publik melalui Pelayanan Publik yang Berkualitas. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, *9*(1), 52–64.
- Saqban, M. R. (2021). Pengaruh Pemungutan Pajak Reklame Terhadap Pendapatan Asli Daerah Pada Badan Pengelola Pajak Dan Retribusi Daerah Kota Medan. 158–164.
- Scott, W. R. (2014). Institutions and organizations: ideas, interests, and identities (4th edition). In *Sage Publications* (4th ed.). Standford University.
- Sugiyono. (2013). Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D. ALFABETA.
- Tarring, A. D. (2022). Carut-Marut Izin Pemasangan Reklame di Kota Makassar. 10, 172–181.

114 | Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Administrasi Publik: Jurnal Pemikiran dan Penelitian Administrasi Publik Volume 13 Number 1, January – June 2023. Page 103-114