

AN ANALYSIS OF TRANSLANGUAGING PRACTICES IN AN INDONESIAN EFL CLASSROOM

Fitrah Al Amir¹, Haryanto Atmowardoyo², Geminastiti Sakkir^{3*}

^{1,2,3}English Department, Universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia

E-mail: [1fitrahalamir@gmail.com](mailto:fitrahalamir@gmail.com), [2haryanto@unm.ac.id](mailto:haryanto@unm.ac.id), [3*geminastitisakkir@unm.ac.id](mailto:geminastitisakkir@unm.ac.id)

*corresponding author

Abstract

This study aimed to find out about in what situation and reason of the teacher to do translanguaging. This research used a qualitative descriptive method and the data was collected through observation and interview. The observation process was carried out in two meetings in class IX.2 SMPN 4 Bulukumba and the interview process was conducted with a teacher. The finding showed that the teacher often practiced translanguaging during the learning process in her class. The teacher usually did translanguaging when greeting students, introducing the lesson, drawing students' attention, explaining the material, asking questions, giving tasks/commands, summarizing the lesson, and closing the meeting. The reason teacher did translanguaging was so that students understand the material being taught better. Based on the findings of the study, it can be concluded that the implementation of translanguaging has a positive impact in the process of teaching and learning English in EFL classroom.

Keywords — *Translanguaging, EFL Classroom, Situation.*

INTRODUCTION

Strategies are a critical element in the learning and teaching process. Selecting the right strategy for delivering material to students can optimize student learning, save time and money, increase student motivation, and increase student creativity. In teaching English as a foreign language, translanguaging is one of several pedagogic strategies' teachers can use to increase the effectiveness of language learning in bilingual or multilingual classrooms, such as in Indonesia.

The general idea of translanguaging involves permitting students to utilize their native language abilities to aid language learning in the classroom that focuses on the target language. "Translanguaging was originally coined in Welsh (Williams, 1994), referred to a pedagogical practice in bilingual education that deliberately changed the language of input and the language of output" (Garcia & Lin, 2017, p. 119). In another definition, Baker (2001) defines

translanguaging as a method where a lesson or text is first presented in one language, but subsequent work such as discussion, writing, or completing a worksheet is done in another language. He further explains that in translanguaging, the input and output are intentionally in different languages, with the language used systematically varied. Typically, the input is in one language (either read or listened to), while the output is in another language (either spoken or written).

In EFL classrooms, such as in Indonesia, some students are proficient enough in using English, but most students have difficulty using English because it is not their daily language. Sahib (2019) explains that students who have difficulty in using English tend to choose to be silent during the learning process. Therefore, the use of translanguaging can be a perfect solution. It can encourage students to learn English by allowing the use of L1 in the classroom. He further suggests that by using translanguaging, teachers and students can establish effective communication, leading to a harmonious learning environment.

Translanguaging can provide several benefits for language learners. These include aiding students in developing conversational strategies, bridging their identities as both native language speakers and English learners, and utilizing their mother tongue as a valuable linguistic tool. This approach can serve as an asset to students and assist them in building effective communication skills in English.

However, there is very little research on translanguaging in Indonesia. Putrawan (2022) explains that there were only 13 studies that had been conducted on translanguaging in Indonesia. Moreover, of the 13 studies, only three studies conducted their research in junior high schools. The three studies were conducted by Sahib, Ukka, Nawing, & Sari (2020) in Manokwari, Rasman (2018) in Yogyakarta, and Sapitri, Gede, & Myartawan (2018) in Singaraja. There has yet to be any research on translanguaging conducted in junior high schools in South Sulawesi. Departing from this, in this study, researcher is interested in researching the implementation of translanguaging in a junior high school in Bulukumba, South Sulawesi. This study investigated about when and why the teacher does translanguaging in an EFL classroom.

LITERATURE REVIEW

1. Bilingualism and Multilingualism

Bilingualism refers to an individual's capacity to proficiently utilize two languages. According to Grosjean (2010), bilingualism refers to a level of competency in two or more

languages, including the capacity for understanding, speaking, reading, and writing in each. Bilingualism is indeed present in practically every country in the world, in all classes of society, and in all age groups, where people grow up speaking and using two languages on a daily basis. Being raised in a bilingual environment or picking up a second language later in life are two ways to attain bilingualism. In another explanation, Rodriguez, Carrasquillo, & Lee (2014, p. 4), "the term bilingualism is generally used to describe the ability of an individual to use two languages in a variety of situations and conditions."

On the other hand, multilingualism is the ability of knowing and speaking more than two languages (García & Li Wei, 2014). They continue by saying that multilingualism is a dynamic and complicated phenomenon that is affected by a variety of elements, including social, psychological, and cognitive factors. According to the Council of Europe (2001), multilingualism refers to the competence of an individual or a community in effectively using two or more languages. for communication, work, learning, or other social activities. This definition highlights the importance of proficiency in multiple languages for a range of purposes.

2. Translanguaging

The concept of translanguaging has recently received a lot of interest in the fields of linguistics and education. It is a process in which bilingual/multilingual individuals use all of their linguistic and cultural resources, including their first (L1) and second (L2) languages, as well as any other language in which they are skilled, to make meaning and communicate effectively in a variety of settings.

"Translanguaging was originally coined in Welsh (Williams 1994), referred to a pedagogical practice in bilingual education that deliberately changed the language of input and the language of output" (Garcia & Lin, 2017, p. 119). Williams (2002) advocates translanguaging for students who are pretty fluent in both languages because it is a strategy for developing bilingualism and is not always helpful in the early stages of language learning.

In another definition, Garcia (2009, p. 140) explains translanguaging as "the act performed by bilinguals of accessing different linguistic features or various modes of what are described as autonomous languages in order to maximize the communicative potential". Garcia (2009, p. 140) then adds, "it is an approach to bilingualism that is centered, not on languages as has often been the case, but on the practices of bilinguals that are readily observable in order to make sense of their multilingual worlds."

3. Functions of Translanguaging

In an educational setting or classroom, translanguaging serves multiple functions, which are typically observed in teaching and learning activities. Saputra & Atmowardoyo (2015) explain that there are ten functions of implementing translanguaging in the EFL class, namely checking understanding, explaining pronunciation and spelling, explaining rule of grammar, explaining exercise in the book, explaining meaning of abstract vocabulary, to co-construct meaning, class management and control, organization classroom setting, telling jokes/anecdotes, and praising.

4. Advantages and Challenges of Translanguaging

Translanguaging can offer many advantages for language learners. Baker (2001) highlights four potential educational benefits associated with translanguaging. These include enhancing a more profound and comprehensive comprehension of the subject matter, supporting the growth of the less proficient language, fostering connections and collaboration between home and school, and aiding the integration of proficient speakers with those who are in the early stages of learning. He explains that if a student is learning in a language that their parents are unfamiliar with or have not fully mastered, translanguaging can aid communication and cooperation between the home and school. It may allow the child to maximize the knowledge they have learned in one linguistic variety at school by using the other variety at home with their parents.

Despite these advantages, there are also some potential drawbacks to translanguaging. The teachers' proficiency in the student's native tongue has been one of the disadvantages of translanguaging. Failure to apply translanguaging could result from teachers' lack of familiarity with students' native tongues (Khojan & Ambele, 2022). Another critique of translanguaging is that it might lead to confusion and misconceptions. When numerous languages are used in the same conversation or writing, it can be difficult for speakers and listeners to keep track of which language is being used for which reason. This can result in misunderstandings or miscommunications, as Baker (2011) argues that translanguaging can result in a lack of clarity and precision and can be particularly problematic in educational contexts where accuracy and standardization are essential. Moreover, translanguaging may cause a learner to rely too much on their first language, which could impede them from completely establishing their L2 proficiency.

5. Translanguaging and Code-Switching

The meaning and applicability of the terms code-switching and translanguaging in English language classrooms have become increasingly ambiguous and subject to debate. It can happen because the concept of both is almost same but actually not at all. Cahyani et al. (2016) clarify that the difference between translanguaging and code-switching is that translanguaging involves the integration of two languages as a single unit to achieve effective communication, whereas code-switching involves the switching back and forth between two separate monolingual codes.

One of the critical differences between translanguaging and code-switching is the intentionality behind the language practice. Translanguaging involves the use of all available linguistic resources, while code-switching is a conscious and intentional decision to switch between languages for a specific purpose. In addition, translanguaging emphasizes the fluidity and flexibility of language use, while code-switching involves a more rigid switching between languages or language varieties. The focus on language proficiency is another difference between translanguaging and code-switching. No matter how proficient a person is in a given language, translanguaging highlights the importance of using all available linguistic resources. On the other hand, code-switching often involves the use of languages or language varieties in which individuals are proficient.

In another explanation, Sahib (2019) differentiates translanguaging and code-switching based on the concept of their use in class. When a teacher uses translanguaging in the class, it's usually done for pedagogical purposes. Teachers utilize translanguaging to clarify concepts and help students comprehend the material more easily. Those are the only function of translanguaging. As an explanatory reason, translanguaging is also means of code-switching. However, code-switching has another function. It can use to both include and exclude people from communication. For instance, if someone wants to convey something to their friends but does not want others to hear, he/she can use code-switching to exclude others.

6. Translanguaging Practice in EFL Classroom

The implementation of translanguaging practices is an effective approach to improve the communication process between EFL teachers and students during classroom interaction. The implementation of translanguaging in EFL classrooms has shown potential benefits for language acquisition, student engagement, and promoting equity in education.

Translanguaging will optimize the student's mastery of L2 since the teaching and learning process is effective (Sahib, 2019).

Translanguaging is usually done by students in EFL classrooms, but unconsciously. This unconscious makes students not aware of the functions and results that can be obtained from the use of translanguaging (Sahib, 2019). Students may utilize translanguaging as a tool to assist them to make their opinions known to teachers during classroom interactions, and teachers may use it as a way to give students opportunities to communicate and enhance student knowledge. Translanguaging simplifies communication between teachers and their students in the classroom. since they do not have to spend as much time attempting to explain to them or looking for the clearest possible term to address any misunderstandings that can develop while teaching.

METHODS

1. Research Design

This research used qualitative research. Furthermore, this research employed a descriptive qualitative research methodology. This kind of research was used to scrutinize the language phenomenon, particularly the utilization of the L1 and the L2 in translanguaging within an EFL classroom. Moreover, descriptive qualitative methodology in this research was used to explain the data obtained in the form of a collection of words to answer the research question about when and why the teacher does translanguaging in the classroom.

2. Research Site and Participants

The school where the research conducted was SMP Negeri 4 Bulukumba. The participant of this research was one teacher in IX.2 grade SMP Negeri 4 Bulukumba. The researcher used purposive sampling technique in taking the participant of the research. The criteria for selecting the English teacher as a participant in this research was a qualified and certified English teacher who has a lot of teaching experience.

3. Instruments of the Research

Observation and interview were adopted as the instruments for data collection in this study. These instruments were chosen for this research in order to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the implementation of translanguaging in EFL classroom and also the

understanding of teacher's reason for translanguaging. The type of observation utilized was non-participant observation. The researcher prepared an observation checklist to obtain data from the teaching and learning process. To get more valuable data for this research, the classroom was observed twice. For the interview, the researcher employed a semi-structured interview technique to acquire information from the teacher. The researcher also utilized video recording, voice recording, and field notes as tools to assist the researcher in collecting the data.

4. Data Analysis Technique

The data of this research was analysed by using thematic analysis. The data analysis process was founded on the six principles proposed by Braun & Clarke (2006) for thematic analysis activities, namely familiarizing with the data, generating initial codes, searching for themes, reviewing themes, defining and naming themes, producing the report.

RESULTS

1. In what situation the teacher does translanguaging

Table 1. Translanguaging practiced by the teacher in class IX.2 SMPN 4 Bulukumba

No.	Language used by the teacher	1 st Meeting			2 nd Meeting		
		Eng.	Ind	Trans lang.	Eng.	Ind	Trans lang.
1.	Pre teaching						
a.	Greeting Students			✓			✓
b.	Introducing the lesson			✓			✓
2.	During teaching						
a.	Explaining the material			✓			✓
b.	Drawing students' attention			✓			✓
c.	Explaining difficult terms		✓			✓	
d.	Asking questions			✓			✓
e.	Giving tasks/command			✓		✓	
f.	Giving feedback		✓			✓	
g.	Students seem not understand		✓			✓	
3.	Post teaching						
a.	Summarizing the lesson			✓			
b.	Closing meeting			✓			✓

The table 1 shows, in the first meeting, the teacher did translanguaging when greeting students, introducing the lesson, explaining the material, drawing students' attention, asking questions, giving tasks/commands, summarizing the lesson, and closing the meeting. In the second meeting, the teacher did translanguaging when greeting students, introducing the lesson, explaining the material, drawing students' attention, asking questions, and closing the meeting. The researcher provided examples of those translanguaging practices in the form of extracts from the classroom interactions as follows:

a. Pre teaching

1) Greeting students

(1st Observation, 25/7/2023)

- T : Good morning?... Good morning?... Saya mengucapkan [I say] good morning, what you say?... Good morning? Jawabannya apa? [What's the answer?] Good morning juga [too] atau [or] morning. Saya ulangi, [I repeat,] good morning?*
- Ss : Morning.*
- T : How are you this morning?*
- Ss : Good.*
- T : Bukan [Not] good, tapi [but] "fine and you?" Saya ulangi, [I repeat,] good morning?*
- Ss : Morning.*
- T : How are you this morning?*
- Ss : Fine, and you?*
- T : I am fine too, thank you.*

The extract shows the process of the teacher greeting students before entering the material. It can be seen that the teacher used translanguaging in the process of greeting students in class, the teacher said, "Good morning?... Good morning?... Saya mengucapkan good morning, what you say?... Good morning? Jawabannya apa? Good morning juga atau morning. Saya ulangi, good morning?". When the teacher started greeting, the students did not reply to the teacher's greeting, so the teacher had to explain how to greet in English. The teacher emphasized her explanation using translanguaging by saying, "Bukan good, tapi "fine and you?" Saya ulangi, good morning?". Students then answered the greeting according to the direction of the teacher.

2) Introducing the lesson

(1st Observation, 25/7/2023)

- T : Harapan, hari ini kita akan belajar itu. [Hope, today we will learn that.] We are going to study... we are going to discuss about Harapan dan Keinginan. [Hope and wish.] Wish and Hope, keinginan dan harapan. [wish and hope.] Wish is keinginan [wish] dan hope is harapan. [hope].*

Extract shows the process of the teacher introducing the lesson to be discussed at the meeting. The teacher introduced the lesson by saying “*Harapan, hari ini kita akan belajar itu. We are going to study... we are going to discuss about Harapan dan Keinginan. Wish and Hope, keinginan dan harapan. Wish is keinginan dan hope is harapan*”. The teacher used translanguaging to explain the material to be studied and explain the meaning of the words wish and hope which shows the function of translanguaging as meaning making.

b. During Teaching

1) Explaining the material

(2nd Observation, 27/7/2023)

T : Nah sekarang... saya akan melanjutkan lagi [Now... I will continue] wish and hope dengan tujuan pembelajaran yang berbeda. [with different learning objectives.] We are still talking about that ya. Wish and Hope, jadi masih keingin dan harapan. [so still wish and hope.] Tujuan pembelajaran hari ini adalah [The objectives of today's lesson is] make a sentence using hope and wish. Atau dalam bahasa Indonesia, membuat kalimat dengan menggunakan [Or in Indonesian, make sentences using] hope and wish. Yang kedua, [Second,] create a dialogue using hope and wish. Jadi membuat sebuah dialog menggunakan [So create a dialog using] hope dan wish. Kemudian yang ketiga, [Then the third,] act the dialogue in front of the class. Jadi beracting, berdialog di depan kelas. [So, act dialogue in front of the class.] I think that's all.

From extract above, it can be seen that the teacher used English and Indonesian in the process of explaining the material to students. In the extract, the teacher explained the learning objectives for that day's learning, the teacher said “*Tujuan pembelajaran hari ini adalah make a sentence using hope and wish. Atau dalam bahasa Indonesia, membuat kalimat dengan menggunakan hope and wish.*” The teacher used two languages in explaining the learning objectives to emphasize the teacher's intentions and to ensure that all students truly understand the learning objectives.

2) Drawing students' attention

(1st Observation, 25/7/2023)

T : Sudah siap?.. Kalau siap kita mulai. [Ready?.. If ready let's start.] I would like to invite from the girls and from the boys dari laki-laki dan dari Perempuan. [from boys and girls.] Saya mulai dari perempuan dulu ya. [I'll start with the girls first.] You two come here! (Pointing towards the girls' chair)

Oke, coba dengar sekarang... [Ok, let's hear it now...] calm down please! calm down please! listen to your friends. Coba yang lain tenang, [the others calm down please,] Hai?... Hello?

Ss : Hello.

The extract above shows that the teacher used translanguaging to draw students' attention. Initially, the teacher asked students to make a dialogue about wish or hope to be displayed in class. Then, when two students wanted to display their dialogues in front of the class, other students were noisy and busy practicing their dialogues. The teacher tried to draw the students' attention by saying and asking, "Oke, coba dengar sekarang... calm down please! calm down please! listen to your friends. Coba yang lain tenang, Hai?... Hello?". Students then answered "Hello" which indicates the teacher has succeeded in drawing students' attention and shows the function of translanguaging as a tool to manage and control the class.

3) Asking questions
(2nd Observation, 27/7/2023)

T : *Ya, about wish and hope. Sekarang, apa itu [Now, what is] wish? Who can differentiate between wish and hope? Siapa yang bisa membedakan?... apa perbedaan, boleh dalam pengertiannya, dalam contohnya boleh juga. [Who can tell the difference?... what's the difference, it's okay in the meaning, in the example it's okay too.]*

The two extracts above are examples of the use of translanguaging by the teacher when asking questions to students. In extract 5, the teacher said "I think that's all, any questions? Ada pertanyaan?", and in extract 6, the teacher said "Who can differentiate between wish and hope? Siapa yang bisa membedakan?" The teacher used two languages to clarify the meaning of her questions. The teacher's translanguaging shows the function of translanguaging to check students' understanding.

4) Giving tasks/command
(1st Observation, 25/7/2023)

T : *I have a sheet, so I want you to, eh this is not a sheet yah, ini bukan tugas... [this is not a task...] I want you to write down in your notebook, di buku catatannya, selain yang diatas ini... jadi kalian catat yang diatas, ditambah dengan ini. Satu kertas satu bangku. Silahkan ditulis di buku catatannya. [in the notebook, besides the above... so you write down the above, plus This. One paper one bench. Please write in the notebook.]
Coba diliat contoh dialog, [Take a look at the dialogue example,] look at contoh dialog [dialogue example] ok. There are three dialogues over there so*

you have to write down only two dialogue saja, [only,] Dialog satu dan dialog tiga, dialog dua janganmi.. tidak usah ditulis. [Dialogue one and dialogue three, dialogue two don't... don't need to write it down.]

Extract 7 above shows the situation where the teacher instructed students to write examples of dialogue about wish and hope in their books. The teacher distributed papers containing examples of dialogues that students will write, the teacher said, *“I have a sheet, so I want you to, eh this is not a sheet yah, ini bukan tugas... I want you to write down in your notebook, di buku catatannya, selain yang diatas ini... jadi kalian catat yang diatas, ditambah dengan ini. Satu kertas. Satu bangku. Silahkan ditulis di buku catatannya.”*. This utterance from the teacher shows that translanguaging is used to clarify direction from the teacher so that students do not experience misunderstandings.

c. Post teaching

1) Summarizing the lesson

(1st Observation, 25/7/2023)

T : After you study this lesson, are you happy? yes or no?

Ss : Yes.

*T : Nah sekarang siapa yang bisa memberikan kesimpulan dari pelajaran ini hari ini [Now who can give a conclusion from today's lesson] raise your hand.. raise your hand please!... ada yang bisa? Kalau bisa berani angkat tangan ya saya tidak akan marah kalau kamu salah. [anyone can? If you can, dare to raise your hand, I won't be angry if you're wrong.]
Oke coba dengarkan [Ok, listen] Silent please, listen your friends!*

S : Dari pelajaran yang tadi diberikan, saya tahu apa perbedaan keinginan dan harapan. [From the lesson that was given earlier, I know what the difference between wish and hope is.]

The extract above shows the end of the learning process, which is the process of summarizing lessons. The teacher summarized the lesson by asking students to conclude what they had learned. Initially, the teacher asked question to students using full English because the words she used were common and simple words, the teacher said *“After you study this lesson, are you happy? yes or no?”* Next, the teacher asked one of the students to give a conclusion, the teacher said, *“Nah sekarang siapa yang bisa memberikan kesimpulan dari pelajaran ini hari ini raise your hand. raise your hand please!...”*. Then, one of the students raised her hand and summed up what she learned that day.

2) Closing meeting
(2nd Observation, 27/7/2023)

T : *Tidak ada lagi ya? Selesai ya, [No more? Done ya,] finish?*
Ok, thank you very much for your attention. And untuk berikutnya, [for the next,] next, pertemuan berikutnya, kita akan membahas ungkapan [next meeting, we will discuss expressions] agree and disagree, ungkapan setuju dan tidak setuju. Jadi kita mempelajari hal itu, silahkan cari informasi mengenai itu, ungkapan persetujuan dan tidak setuju. [agree and disagree expressions. So, we study it, please find information about it, agree and disagree expressions.]
Thank you very much, and saya akhiri dengan ucapan [I will end by saying] Wassalamualaikum warahmatullahi wabarakatuh.

Extract above show the practice of translanguaging by the teacher in closing the meeting. In the extract the teacher said *“Thank you very much for your attention”* which is a general English expression. Then the teacher explained the activities at the next meeting using Indonesian, the teacher said *“And untuk berikutnya, next, pertemuan berikutnya, kita akan membahas ungkapan agree and disagree, ungkapan setuju dan tidak setuju. Jadi kita mempelajari hal itu, silahkan cari informasi mengenai itu, ungkapan persetujuan dan tidak setuju.”*

2. The reason of the teacher to do translanguaging
(Teacher, 2/8/2023)

“Pertama, karena bahasa Inggris di SMP itu sama halnya di SD, itu kan dasar. Jadi kalau misalnya seperti anak yang baru diajarkan bahasa... otomatis kita harus combine toh, digabungkan. Digabungkan dengan bahasa Inggris bahasa Indonesia, dengan bahasa mereka, supaya mereka lebih paham.” (First, because English in junior high school is the same as in elementary school, that's basic. So, for example, it's like a child who has just been taught a language... we automatically have to combine it, though. Combined with English, Indonesian, with their language, so they understand better.)

Based on extract above, it can be seen the reason of the teacher to use of translanguaging in her English class. The teacher explained that the reason she does translanguaging is so that students understand the learning material being discussed better. The teacher stated that English in junior high school is still at a basic level. Therefore, using two languages, English and Indonesian, is necessary in class.

DISCUSSIONS

1. In what situation the teacher does translanguaging

Based on the results of the transcripts from the observation, it was found that the teacher often practiced translanguaging during the English learning process in her class. The teacher used translanguaging in the classroom to make meaning, emphasize the teacher's intentions, manage and control the class, check student understanding, and clarify meaning. In research conducted by Liando, Tatipang, & Lengkoan (2022) explain that the implementation of translanguaging by teachers is used to support and clarify the meaning of what the teacher said previously. But even though the teacher almost always used translanguaging in various learning activities in her class, the researcher saw that the portion of the use of English was lower than the use of Indonesian. The teacher was more dominant in using Indonesian during the learning process. Based on the researcher's observation, the teacher's dominant use of Indonesian in class is so that students are not confused about what the teacher is conveying, considering that students' English proficiency is still low.

2. The reason of the teacher to do translanguaging

The findings obtained from the interview process conducted with the teacher show that the teacher did translanguaging in her class so that students have a better understanding of the learning material. The teacher emphasized the importance of combining the two languages so that students do not feel confused during the learning process. The teacher's reason for translanguaging, as described above, is in line with the explanation of Riswanto in his research. Riswanto (2022) explains the use of students' first language by the teacher in foreign language learning class makes students understand the material better. He continues that the application of translanguaging is suitable for use by teachers when explaining difficult grammar or vocabulary meanings.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings and discussions, it can be concluded that the English teacher in class IX.2 of SMPN 4 Bulukumba often practiced translanguaging during the learning process in her class. The teacher did translanguaging when greeting students, introducing the lesson, explaining the material, drawing students' attention, asking questions, giving tasks/command, summarizing the lesson, and when closing meeting which shows the significance of its role in

the delivery of lessons. The teacher's reason for doing translanguaging in her class is so that students can better understand the material being taught.

REFERENCES

- Baker, C. (2001). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism* (3rd ed.). Clevedon: Multilingual Matters
- Baker, C. (2011). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism* (5th ed.), Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Cahyani, H., de Courcy, M., & Barnett, J. (2016). Teachers' Code-Switching in Bilingual Classrooms: Exploring Pedagogical and Sociocultural Functions. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 21(4), 465-479.
- Council of Europe. (2001). *Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, Teaching, Assessment*. Cambridge University Press.
- García, O. (2009). Education, Multilingualism and Translanguaging in the 21st Century. In *Social Justice Through Multilingual Education* (pp. 140–158). Multilingual Matters.
- García, O., & Li, W. (2014). *Translanguaging: Language, Bilingualism and Education*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- García, O., Lin, A. M. Y., & May, S. (Eds.). (2017). *Bilingual and Multilingual Education*. Springer International Publishing.
- Grosjean, F. (2010). *Bilingual: Life and Reality*. Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Khairunnisa, K., & Lukmana, I. (2020). Teachers' Attitudes Towards Translanguaging in Indonesian EFL Classrooms. *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan*, 20(2), 254-266.
- Khojan, S., & Ambele, E. A. (2022). *Teachers' Perceptions and Practices of Translanguaging in Thai EFL Classroom* (Doctoral dissertation, Mahasarakham University).
- Liando, N. V., Tatipang, D. P., & Lengkoan, F. (2022). A study of translanguaging practices in an EFL classroom in Indonesian context: A multilingual concept. *Research and Innovation in Language Learning*, 5(2), 167-185.
- Putrawan, G. E. (2022). Translanguaging Practices in EFL Classrooms: Evidence from Indonesia. *CaLLs (Journal of Culture, Arts, Literature, and Linguistics)*, 8(1), 69-86.
- Riswanto, R. (2022). Exploring Translanguaging as a Pedagogical Strategy used by the English Teacher in EFL Classroom Setting. *JPGI (Jurnal Penelitian Guru Indonesia)*, 7(1), 96-103.
- Rodriguez, D., Carrasquillo, A., & Lee, K. S. (2014). *The Bilingual Advantage: Promoting Academic Development, Biliteracy, and Native Language in the Classroom*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Sahib, R. B. (2019). The Use of Translanguaging as a Pedagogical Strategy in EFL Classroom: A Case Study at Bulukumba Regency. *LET Linguistics, Literature and English Teaching Journal*, 9(2), 154-180.
- Saputra, W. A., & Atmowardoyo, H. (2015). Translanguaging in Indonesian University Classroom Context: A Discourse Analysis at Muhammadiyah University in South Sulawesi. *English Language Teaching (ELT) Worldwide*, 2(1), 42-62.
- Williams, C. (2002). *Ennill iaith: Astudiaeth o sefyllfa drochi yn 11 - 16 oed* [A Language Gained: A Study of Language Immersion at 11-16 years of age]. Bangor, UK: School of Education.