

# THE USE OF SAME-LANGUAGE SUBTITLES ON YOUTUBE VIDEOS TOWARDS STUDENTS' LISTENING COMPREHENSION: ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES

Andi Musfiqah Shalihah<sup>1</sup>, Syarifah Farahdiba<sup>2\*</sup>, Ryan Rayhana Sofyan<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup>English Department, Universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia

E-mail: [1figoshalihah@gmail.com](mailto:1figoshalihah@gmail.com), [2syfarahdiba@unm.ac.id](mailto:2syfarahdiba@unm.ac.id), [3ryanrayhana@unm.ac.id](mailto:3ryanrayhana@unm.ac.id)

\*corresponding author

## Abstract

*This study aims to find out the advantages and disadvantages of same-language subtitles on YouTube videos. The researcher applies the descriptive qualitative method to achieve the research objective. This research uses interview questions as an instrument of the study. The subject of this research is 6 students from the English Education Department 2019 academic year, Faculty of Languages and Literature, Universitas Negeri Makassar. The subject was chosen by using purposive sampling. The results of this research revealed that students stated the advantages of same-language subtitles include high accuracy, explaining slang, and clear punctuation. Disadvantages include inaccurate timestamps, typos, and words that are not displayed.*

**Keywords** — Students' perception, listening, same-language subtitle.

## INTRODUCTION

The ability to listen requires a lot of mental effort in a short amount of time. Listening is the simplest yet complex skill, compared to speaking, reading, and writing, listening skill takes a short amount of time to put into practice. Tomlinson (2018:426) stated that listening skill is the most fundamental of all the skills. By mastering listening skills, Learners of English as a Foreign Language (EFL) can have direct conversations and comprehend what is said by native speakers.

At the beginning of their language studies, a new language learner should practice listening in the same way that a child learns their mother tongue (Buck, 2001). This is because a child's ability to listen develops early in the process of learning a language. Learning a new language requires a lot of listening. According to Underwood (1989), A child learns a significant quantity of linguistic information by listening before developing speaking, writing, and reading skills.

For learners to enhance their listening comprehension abilities, there are numerous

options, they can learn directly in the classroom, speak directly to native speakers, and watch videos or films that use English as the main language. Teaching English as a Foreign Language (EFL) through movies and other visual media has recently gotten a lot of attention since it can help students stay motivated while also giving them crucial authentic listening practice. Because they are a rich source of talk and discourse by English speakers, video materials can be used as an alternate instructional method for teaching listening. This can make pronunciation much easier to understand.

As technology advances, it has become increasingly simple for students to gain access to a variety of video media providers via the Internet. For example, YouTube offers a wealth of videos in a variety of languages, many with automatically generated or user-created subtitles, that students may watch nearly anywhere for prolonged EFL practice outside of class. Because of its growing popularity, the fact that students can watch it for free, and its somewhat faulty character, which necessitates unique investigation, this study focused on YouTube in particular. Subtitles have been suggested as a technique for subtitles to aid EFL learning by improving students' listening ability. According to Ryu (2011), Students' linguistic awareness is improved by using subtitles, which is a key component in learning expressions from movies. Woodall (2010) suggested that reading and listening to the same text at the same time can improve listening skill than without using the same text at the same time. A lot of factors have been linked to improved EFL and foreign language acquisition, but enjoyment, repeat viewing, and the length of time spent watching videos with English subtitles are three that may influence the effectiveness of watching videos with English subtitles. Everyone has their own perception of something. According to Montague (1997), a student's perception is what they feel about something. Jacobs (2004) considers perception to be one of the key factors underlying effective teaching and learning. Students' perception is one of the important factors that need to be considered in the process of learning. In this case, it was important to consider how the students felt about the use of this same-language subtitle feature as viewers of YouTube videos.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

### 1. Perception

Perception is a person's behavior or comprehension of something that is around them or that they experience. Everyone has their own perception of something. Jacobs (2004) refers perception to be one of the key factors underlying effective teaching and learning. Perception,

according to philosophy, psychology, and cognitive science, is the process of being aware of or comprehending sensory information Qiong (2017). perception is the point of view after the observation occur after the events or treatment that is done by individuals and their reactions that show the behavior towards the events. In this study, perception was very important, as information was gathered from respondents to ascertain their perspectives and experiences about same-language subtitle on their learning video on YouTube.

## 2. Listening

According to Richards (1992:344), listening comprehension is “the process of understanding speech in a first or second language”. They also state that “the study of listening Comprehension processes in second language learning focuses on the role of individual linguistic units (e.g., Phonemes, Words, grammatical structures) as well as the role of listener’s expectations, the situation and context, background knowledge and the topic. Rost (2011:1) stated that in spoken language processing, listening is one of the crucial components. There would be no spoken language without listening. They also add that “listening is also an area that is interconnected with numerous areas of inquiry and development”. Listening is the ability to receive the true meaning of the interlocutor by trying to feel and see their point of view. Listening also has an influence on other skills that language learners need.

## 3. YouTube Platform

### a. YouTube video as Learning source

Due to the massive development of technology today, there are many platforms or applications that contain videos that can be used as learning resources by students. Various platforms such as Google Video, Ruangguru, Instagram, and among the many learning resources, YouTube is the platform most used by students (Muhammad et al., 2014). YouTube itself was launched in 2005 by Steve Chen, Chad Hurley, and Jawed Karim. Since then, YouTube has continued to grow and become more popular among people and become a source of watching various video content for free, various content in YouTube videos can be in the form of music, entertainment, comedy, animation, vlogs, and also for educational needs. According to Daz-Cintas & Remeal (2007, subtitles are): a kind of translation that involves showing a written text that attempts to recount both the speakers' original dialogue and any discursive elements present in the image (such as letters, inserts, graffiti, inscriptions, signs, etc.), usually

in the lower portion of the screen. Through the YouTube platform, EFL students can find content in the form of conversations or monologues sourced directly from native speakers with their distinct accents that can increase students' interest in learning English.

b. Subtitle Feature

The subtitle feature on YouTube was first introduced in 2006, a year after YouTube was launched. This feature can be activated by clicking on the "cc" symbol in the lower right corner or upper right corner of the layer when playing a video on YouTube. This subtitle feature is divided into two, namely Auto captioned and edited subtitles. Auto-captioned subtitles utilize voice recognition technology which then automatically displays subtitles on the screen when the feature is activated. Automated subtitles are produced using automatic speech recognition (ASR) software to generate a verbatim transcript of spoken dialogue, according to Wald & Bain's (2008) explanation. Meanwhile, edited subtitles provided by the video owner are inputted in the video which is then synchronized by YouTube according to the spoken word on the video.

This research focused on edited subtitles which have higher accuracy when compared to auto-captioned subtitles because the text was verbatim revised by a subtitler for grammar, spelling, and segmentation.

## METHODS

This study used a qualitative method that aims to produce data processing derived from list of questions given to the sample. This research also used a descriptive approach to the process to describe the existing problems through data collected and analyzed so that they can be interpreted. This study was carried out at English Department, Faculty of Language and Literature, Universitas Negeri Makassar. The location is based on consideration from the researcher's mini observation with 8th semester students in English language education program. They stated that they often use and take advantage of the subtitles feature on YouTube videos to assist them understand the content of the video through listening. The research was conducted from February 2023 until March 2023. The research site was decided by the researcher. The data resources of this research were purposively selected, they are 6 8th semester students of English education study program who have experienced using same-language subtitle on their You-Tube videos in the process of listening. In-depth interview used in this study as the research tool, according to gay (2012) An interview is a designed conversation where one person asks another for information. Researchers can delve deeply

into participants' responses during interviews to learn more about their experiences and sentiments. For this study's structured interviews, a predetermined set of questions was required to extract participants' opinions on the use of subtitles in the same language. The questions of the interview include open questions. The data collection method used in this study is qualitative data by conducting in-depth interview. The researcher prepared several questions for the interview and deciding the list of the respondents for the interview about their perception of the use of the same-language subtitle toward their listening comprehension. Each student does online face-to face interview, while the researcher takes notes and audio taping throughout interview. The interview was conducted for approximately 15-20 minutes.

In analyzing the data that has been collected, the researcher uses data analysis technique by Miles & Huberman (2014:10). The first stage of this analysis is data condensation, which is the process of selecting, focusing, simplifying, abstracting, and/or transforming the data. In this study, the researcher simplified the data that had been collected by classifying the data based on how important the data was. By using this method, the researcher can produce useful and important information for drawing research conclusions.

The second stage is the data display, according to Miles & Huberman (2014:10) displaying the data means organized and arranging the data to make it easier for the researcher to decide what is the next step, either draw conclusions or do further research to find out the useful information for making the conclusion. The last step is conclusion, where the researcher draws the result of the data regarding the students' perception of the use of same-language subtitle on YouTube video.

## RESULTS

The findings of the research reveal the result of interview to answer the research questions in the first chapter: What are the advantages and disadvantages of same-language subtitle on YouTube videos experienced by the students. It is found that there are three advantages of same-language subtitle feature.

### 1. High accuracy

Based on experience from using the Same-Language Edited Subtitle feature, Students feel that Same-Language edited subtitles have a high accuracy. "As long as I use edited subtitles, they are accurate, exactly what the speaker says with what is written)". The student admitted

that the same-language edited subtitle feature has high accuracy because what the speaker says is the same as what appears in the edited subtitle.

## 2. Explaining slang

it was found that based on experience while using the Same-Language Edited Subtitle feature, Student found that the feature helped to explain the slang used by speakers on the video. "The person who made the content explains the meaning of the slang even though the words become longer" and "What I mean about explaining slang in the Same-Language Edited Subtitle feature, is that there is a video where the content creator calls or says a slang, such as 'Spill the Tea'. However, what is written in the subtitle is not the same, it shows 'tell me more' instead on the subtitle. In my opinion, it is an advantage if given a clearer context or given an additional explanation so that people can understand and compare it". the student admitted that the Same-Language Edited Subtitle feature helps them in understanding the slang spoken by the speaker in the video, the feature explains a particular slang that is likely only known by certain audiences.

## 3. Clear punctuation

It was found that based on experience during using the Same-Language Edited Subtitle feature, these features have a clear punctuation on each subtitle that are displayed. "When using Edited Subtitles, we understand more how to pronounce it, where is the dots, the comma too" and "I mean by having a clear punctuation is that it will make easier for us to understand the video that is watched and does not change the meaning of the sentence that is said because it uses a clear punctuation". The student admitted that the Same-Language Edited Subtitle feature can place dots, commas, and other punctuation appropriately on each sentence so that the audience can more clearly understand the purpose of the speaker in the video.

Meanwhile, there are three disadvantages found of same-language subtitle feature on YouTube videos:

### 1. Inaccurate timestamp

Based on the analysis of the interview result, it was found that the Same-Language Edited Subtitle feature has an inaccurate subtitle timestamp. "Sometimes the placement of subtitles is not on time" and "Usually there is a video that the subtitles are slow to appear, when the speaker spoke the words but the subtitles appear late". The student admitted that the Same-

Language Edited Subtitle feature sometimes has a lack of timestamp, the subtitles displayed are sometimes too fast or too fast disappearing or vice versa, it appears or is too slow to disappear.

## 2. Typo

It was found that the same-language edited subtitle features sometimes have errors in typing so that the subtitles that appear are not quite right. "Usually if there is a mistake, it might be more to the mistakes of the typing or typo that I encountered" and "Maybe there are some words that are typo or something". The student admitted that there were several typing errors in the same-language edited subtitle feature they used. This can be overcome by guessing the word that should be displayed because the error that occurs is usually just an error in typing the letter so the students can guess what letter should be used.

## 3. Words that are not displayed or not in accordance with the speech

it was found that the Same-Language Edited Subtitle feature sometimes does not bring up one or two words spoken by the speaker in the video. "Only in the lack of accuracy in typing it, so what I hear is not suitable for what is written in the subtitles" and "Sometimes there are a few sentences or words that may not have been typed in the subtitles by the editor". The student admitted that same-language edited subtitles feature sometimes do not bring up one or two words spoken by the speaker in the video and should appear in the subtitles, so, students need to listen again carefully what the speaker says to be able to understand the context of the video.

## DISCUSSIONS

Advantages found of same-language subtitle feature on YouTube videos:

### 1. High accuracy

The first advantage when using the same-language edited subtitle feature experienced by the students is that the feature has a fairly high level of accuracy. Even if something is not right, it is still easy for students to overcome. This can be seen in one of the student statements "As long as I use edited subtitles, they are accurate, exactly what the speaker says with what is written." It is in line with the study from Chan, Kruger & Doherty (2019) which showed that

corrected subtitle has better quality and high accuracy rate comparing to the auto generated subtitle.

## 2. Explaining slang

The second advantage is the same-language edited subtitle feature explaining slang that only certain groups understand is spoken in the video using easy-to-understand explanations, so that the context conveyed in the video can be understood properly by the audience. This is evidenced by one of the student statements “What I mean about explaining slang in the Same-Language Edited Subtitle feature, is that there is a video where the content creator calls or says a slang, such as 'Spill the Tea'. However, what is written in the subtitle is not the same, it shows 'tell me more' instead on the subtitle. In my opinion, it is an advantage if given a clearer context or given an additional explanation so that people can understand and compare it.” It is supported by Ambarsari (2018) which stated that subtitle should show the correct meaning which show the idea or the message in the movie or video to get the certain effect, by explaining the slang words to the understandable words, people able to know it meaning.

## 3. Clear punctuation

The third advantage of same-language edited subtitles is the accurate punctuation, this feature clearly places full stop, comma, exclamation marks and other punctuation marks when displaying subtitles so that viewers are more comfortable and easier to understand what they want to convey through subtitles. This can be seen in one of the student statements “I mean by having a clear punctuation is that it will make easier for us to understand the video that is watched and does not change the meaning of the sentence that is said because it uses a clear punctuation.” This finding is supported by the research from Tiedemann (2016) that with using the punctuation right with the subtitle can be very useful for error correction and text normalization.

Disadvantages found of same-language subtitle feature on YouTube videos:

### 1. Inaccurate timestamp

The first disadvantage of same-language edited subtitles on YouTube videos experienced by the students is that the timestamp of the subtitle is sometimes inaccurate, the appearance of the subtitles on this feature is sometimes too fast or too slow, so it doesn't match the tempo of the speaker in the video which can be difficult students in understanding the content of the

video. It is evidenced by the student's statement "There is subtitle that is late sometimes, or the speaker does not speak yet, but the subtitles have been replaced or may not be replaced." This finding is supported by research from Putri (2018) stated that subtitles can have various problems such as incorrect tone, space, and time. And it is line with Aulia & Nugroho (2022) showed that the duration that appears on screen should correspond to the length of time the speakers speak their conversation. Because the subtitle should not be vanished untimely, as viewers would not have sufficient time to read properly.

## 2. Typo

The second drawback of same-language edited subtitles on YouTube videos experienced by the students is the problem of typing errors, some students find typing errors in the edited subtitles used. This can be seen in the student's statement which states, "Usually if there is a mistake, it might be more to the mistakes of the typing or typo that I encountered." This finding is supported by the research from Deckert (2021) which found that students spotted typos and even in the extreme condition which featured as many as 20 typos in a 14-minutes video. In this case, spelling errors have been seen as one of the key elements that detract from subtitling quality.

## 3. Words that are not displayed or not in accordance with the speech

The third disadvantage of same-language edited subtitles on YouTube videos experienced by the students is that the subtitles sometimes don't show one or two words spoken by the speaker in the video which causes them to not be able to understand the video content properly, so they need to listen again carefully and trying to understand what the speaker is saying without the help of the same-language edited subtitle feature. This can be seen from one of the student statements "It only does not include 2 or 3 words so that sometimes we do not get the context, the sentence is what is meant by the speaker." This finding is in line with the theory from Szarkowska (2020) which there is mishearing of the dialogue in subtitling, this includes as one of the factors that can shape the quality of subtitle.

## CONCLUSION

The researcher concluded that the same-language edited subtitle function on YouTube acquired a lot of positive evaluations from the students based on the findings and discussion in

the previous chapter. It is shown from the research findings that this feature can help them during watching English videos on the YouTube platform. By using the same-language edited subtitle feature, students perceived the advantages and disadvantages of this same-language subtitle feature as technology. Students stated that this feature had high accuracy, explained slang, and had clear punctuation. On the other hand, students complained that the same-language edited subtitle feature is sometimes inaccurate in the timestamp of the appearance of the subtitle, some typing errors, and several words that are not displayed or not by the speech.

## REFERENCES

- Aulia, A., & Nugroho, R. A. (2022). Comparative Translation Analysis of Subtitle and Dubbing in "Raya and the Last Dragon". *Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics*, 578-579.
- Díaz-Cintas, J., & Remael, A. (2007). *Audiovisual translation: Subtitling*. Kinderhook, New York: St. Jerome.
- Gay, L. R. (1992). *Educational Research: Competencies for Analysis and Application (4th ed)*.. New York: Macmillan Publishing Company.
- Jacobs, A., Pinto, J., & Shiffrar, M. (2004). Experience, Context, and the Visual Perception of Human Movement. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Human Perception and Performance*, 30(5), 822–835.
- Miles, B. M, Huberman, M, & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis*. Third Edition. Sage Publication, Los Angeles.
- Muhammad, A.-I., Alqahtani, E. T., Na'eem, O., & Abdelrahman, B. (2014). *Kingdom of Saudi Arabia Ministry of Higher Education Effectiveness of Using YouTube on Enhancing EFL Students' Listening Comprehension Skills* Riyadh-Saudi Arabia. 1–62.
- Putra, I. P. (2014). Learning Vocabulary Using English Movie with Subtitles in SMAK Santo Yoseph. 1-8.
- Qiong, O. (2017). A Brief Introduction to Perception. *Studies in Literature and Language*, 18-20.
- Richard, J. C. (1992). *Longman dictionary of language teaching and applied linguistic*. London: Longman Group UK Limited.
- Rost, M. (2011). *Teaching and Researching Listening*. New York: Routledge.
- Ryu, D. H. (2011). The Effects of Film Subtitles on Students' Language Awareness. *Teaching English Through Movies: ATEM Journal*, 16, 17-31.
- Sofyan, R. R., & Mushrihah, A. (2019). Learning Difficulties in Listening Comprehension. *Eralingua: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Asing dan Sastra Vol.3*, 86-92.
- Tomlinson, B, & Masuhara, H. (2018). *The Complete Guide to the Theory and Practice of Materials Development for Language Learning*. Oxford: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Tiedemann, J. (2016). Finding Alternative Translation in a Large Corpus of Movie Subtitles. 3518-3522.
- Underwood, M. (1989): *Teaching Listening*. London: Longman.
- Wald, M., & Bain, K. (2008). Universal access to communication and learning: The role of automatic speech recognition. *Universal Access in the Information Society*, 6(4), 435–447.
- Woodall, B. (2010). Simultaneous Listening and Reading in ESL: Helping Second Language Learners Read (and Enjoy Reading) More Efficiently. *TESOL Journal*, 1(2), 186-205.

Zahro, L. (2022). *The Effectiveness Of Using Subtitle In Youtube Video Content On Students' Listening Ability At First Grade Of SMPN 1 Kalidawir*. Thesis. English Education Department. Faculty of Education and Teacher Training. State 186-205.