# Implementation of Authentic Assessment: A Case Study in Sanggar Anak Alam Yogyakarta

**Olyvia Vita Ardhani** Sanata Dharma University, Indonesia

Email: olyviavitaa19@gmail.com

Abstract. This study aims reveal implementation of authentic assessment in Sanggar Anak Alam Yogyakarta, including the obstacles encountered by the facilitator and its solution. This is a qualitative study with a case study as the research design to achieve those goals. The data is gathered from focus group interviews classroom observation. Three facilitators participated in the focus group discussion, and two classes were observed. The finding reveals that the facilitators assess their pupils authentically. It means that the facilitators assess not only the pupils' cognitive development but also their affective and psychomotor development. It can be seen from the pupils' report cards, which are in the form of a detailed narrative about the result of the pupils' learning process. However, in implementing the authentic assessment, the facilitators encounter Those obstacles are obstacles. constraints and the ability to analyze the data. Nevertheless, the facilitators can overcome these difficulties by managing their time better and getting used to analyzing pupils' data. It can be concluded that the facilitators in Sanggar Anak Alam have implemented authentic assessments to asses their pupils.

**Keywords:** Authentic Assessment, Facilitator, Implementation

# INTERFERENCE

Journal of Language, Literature,and Linguistics

E-ISSN: 2721-1835 P-ISSN: 2721-1827

Submitted : 03<sup>rd</sup> January 2023 Accepted : 27<sup>th</sup> February 2023

#### **INTRODUCTION**

Education is the process of conveying knowledge from one person to another, individually and simultaneously. One crucial part of education is the assessment process. Padmanabha (2021, p. 14) explained that assessment "refers to the action of gathering proof and building discernment related to the outcomes, such as students' achievement of particular goals of learning or teachers and other' understanding." In other words, assessment is collecting and processing information to determine learning needs, development, and achievement of pupils' learning outcomes. The results are then used as material for reflection and the basis for improving the quality of learning. The results of the assessment can also be a guide for the teacher to determine how to manage the teaching strategies in class, how to place pupils in different learning programs, provide levels of assignments for pupils according to their abilities and needs, provide guidance and counselling, and suggestions for further study. Therefore, assessment cannot be separated from the educational process because it can reflect the teachers' success in teaching.

The nature of assessment is expected and required to change to support 21st\_ century learning (Ozen & Ozen, 2022). Therefore, the traditional assessment methods have to shift into authentic assessments to meet the era's demands. Khairil & Mokshein (2018) explain that in this new era, assessment is needed to know how the pupils learn and master the concept and skills. In addition, a 21st-century assessment is an assessment designed to be able to measure and map the achievement of a competency authentically. Along that line, the authentic assessment model is suitable to meet the assessment criteria of this 21st-century assessment. Authentic assessment involves the pupils in realistic situations where they apply what they have learned during the course or program to solve a problem. Authentic assessment neither does ask the pupils to memorize nor regurgitate theoretical information. It requires the pupils to contextualize the knowledge they gain at school in a real-world context. This is in line with Palm (2008) that authentic assessment focuses on more or less specified cognitive processes argued to be important in life beyond school and required to be true to the situation outside the particular school subject. Using authentic assessment methods, the teacher can realistically evaluate a pupil's ability based on how they apply what they have learned to the assignment. Moreover, through an authentic assessment, teachers can know the progress and achievement of pupils' learning. They can express, prove and demonstrate precisely that the learning objectives have been completely mastered and achieved with motivation and attitude toward learning.

Teachers are required to make specific plans in order to implement authentic assessments. First and foremost, they must create learning objectives and authentic assessments that are as appropriate and feasible for the pupils as possible. Brown & Sambell (2022) suggested six steps to design an authentic assessment. They are: (1) learning outcomes matter, (2) turning the verbs from the learning outcomes into active assessment tasks, (3) identifying the object of the verb, (4) the subject or professional context, (5) outcomes and evidence of achievement, (6) modifiers, development, and range statements. Another essential part of implementing authentic assessment is the scoring instrument.

Sanggar Anak Alam has been famous for the concept of independent pupils since they were founded, long before the government enacted the *Merdeka Belajar* policy. Sanggar Anak Alam, abbreviated as SALAM, has various levels of education, from playgrounds to high school. This school was built because of concerns with the education system. Unlike the conventional school, SALAM is not a subject-based school. Moreover, to appreciate every pupil who has their uniqueness (Irmayanti & Wijayanti, 2020), pupils have the freedom to choose what they want to learn because pupils have different interests. In addition, this school does not have a teacher. The pupils learn independently with assistance from facilitators. The facilitators stimulate pupils' learning enthusiasm and do not feed the pupils with various kinds of knowledge.

Furthermore, SALAM believes that interpreting education is not only increasing knowledge because gaining knowledge can be quickly done by reading books, watching YouTube, or listening to podcasts, unlike learning. Learning is presenting experience. Thus, allowing the pupils to experience their learning process is a form of the educational process that emphasizes the importance of learning from experience, as stated by Benjamin Franklin "Tell me, and I forget. Teach me, and I remember. Involve me, and I learn."

SALAM curriculum is research-based, and research is understood as a pupil's learning process. The research being carried out is not merely a cognitive process to build new knowledge but rather a process that involves the multidimensional nature of the pupils, who, together with their parents, are trying to identify what is their interest by sharing their potential. It is used to determine the theme of their research focus. Each pupil is free to choose their research theme. Like scientific research, research by SALAM pupils begins with problematization, the process of formulating research problems. Finding answers to research questions flows naturally but within a clear planning framework under the guidance of the facilitators. From the research theme taken, it can lead to holistic learning; for example, pupils exploring traditional food themes. They can study mathematics, natural sciences, earth sciences, economics, and social and cultural sciences. The facilitator helps make a concept map that will be passed so that there is an agreed-upon curriculum by three parties earlier the facilitator, the pupil, and the parents. Therefore, the curriculum is a very personal, unique curriculum that is different for all pupils.

As mentioned above that, every pupil has their curriculum. Therefore, the assessments for every pupil are different. The facilitators have a different way of assessing their pupils. Consequently, each pupil has their assessment standard by the agreed-upon agreement between the pupil, the parents, and the facilitator. Because their task in school is conducting research, the facilitator assesses them from the beginning. Irmayanti & Wijayanti (2020) stated that "SALAM seeks to focus on children's learning experiences, not only on the academic values." Therefore, authentic assessment is the suitable assessment method applied at SALAM. The pupils are assessed from every research process they go through.

Using authentic assessment to assess pupils has been discussed by various scholars. Aliningsih & Sofwan (2015) investigated the English teachers' perception and practices of authentic assessment in the pilot project school of the 2013

curriculum in Grobogan regency. The result shows the teachers' positive perceptions of authentic assessment. Moreover, Jopp (2019) discussed the necessity, challenge, and opportunity to develop a shared understanding of authentic assessment by exploring its value and intent regarding student learning outcomes and employability skills. The study reveals that authentic assessment has the potential to increase student engagement, deepen levels of understanding, increase creativity, and reduce plagiarism. Conducted descriptive research to determine the impact of authentic assessment strategies on the pupils' performance. The research reveals a positive relationship between the use of authentic assessment strategies teachers use and the pupils' academic performances. However, there are numerous challenges faced by teachers in employing authentic assessment.

However, previous research has not discussed in detail and depth the implementation of authentic assessment, including the difficulties faced by teachers and how they overcome these difficulties. Because of that, this present study is expected to fill those gaps. Therefore, this present study is intended to discover how are the implementation of authentic assessment, the challenges faced by the facilitators, and its solution in Sanggar Anak Alam. This study can offer a big picture of the implementation of authentic assessment for pre-service and in-service teachers.

## **METHODOLOGY**

Since the present study is concerned with authentic assessment implementation in SALAM, a case study design was employed. A case study is a qualitative research in which the researcher focuses on a unit of study (Gay et al., 2012). The subjects of the study were three facilitators in Sanggar Anak Alam. Meanwhile, the study's objective is to implement an authentic assessment to assess the pupils' progress. Collecting data is an essential part of conducting a study. This study applied focus group interviews, and class observations to obtain the data. The focus group interviews employed in this study were semi-structured since further discussion and questioning could go further than what was listed in the interview questions (Barkhuizen et al., 2014).

For the classroom observation, the researcher decided to be a non-participative observer. According to Fraenkel et al. (2012), in a nonparticipant observation study, the researcher does not participate in the observed activity but rather sits on the sidelines, watches the activity, and is not involved in the classroom. By being a non-participative observers, the learning process runs naturally, as usual. Moreover, classroom observation was done to see how the facilitators assess their pupils by utilizing authentic assessment.

After the data were obtained, they were analyzed using the six steps of Creswell's (2012) analysis model. First, the researcher transcribed the interview and prepared the document needed. Then, the data was coded into some themes. After the data was coded, the researcher built the code into descriptions and themes. Fourth, the researcher reported it as a narrative discussion. Then, the researcher interpreted the findings. The last step was to validate the finding by using triangulation.

To achieve the validity, strength, and interpretative potential of a study, to decrease investigator bias, and to provide multiple perspectives, this study used the triangulation of sources. The data were obtained from different sources of information. Shenton (2004) explains that triangulation involves the different sources of data. Thus, the triangulation in this study was done by comparing the data obtained from the focus group interview and classroom observation. The data from the different sources had been cross-checked. Some irrelevant data was eliminated to meet the objectives of the study.

#### **RESULT AND DISCUSSION**

The findings from the classroom observations and focus group interviews was analyzed explicitly on three themes to generate the conclusions. The themes were the implementation of authentic assessment to assess pupils' performance, the obstacles encountered by facilitators in doing so, and the facilitators' solutions to those difficulties.

#### The Implementation of Authentic Assessment

The implementation was divided into three stages: designing the authentic assessment, implementing it, assessing pupils' work, and providing feedback to pupils. It was discovered that teachers employed six processes proposed by Brown and Sambell (2022) in planning and designing authentic assessments. However, steps one and the other could be more detailed and sometimes overlap. The focus group interviews reveal that all the facilitators are hand in hand to integrate their guidance.

Every pupil is unique and has different interests. We cannot make them uniform by providing the same learning outcomes for them. By giving this, the independence of pupils to learn is taken away. Budiraharja, Muti'ah & Sugiarto (2021) state that creating space for independent thinking and learning in educational process is important to achieve a complete human being who is independent physically and spiritually. Thus, appreciating and realizing that every pupil has a different interest, SALAM does not have the same learning outcomes for all pupils. Moreover, the assessment in SALAM includes three aspects, affective, cognitive, and psychomotor. Besides, the facilitators never give the pupils ordinary assignments, which commonly only answer questions. Here, a real-world task is always given to the pupils to promote authentic assessment. Because authentic assessment gives the pupils the experience to practice real-life problem-solving skills, communication and critical thinking, networking, and collaboration (Aziz, Yusoff & Yaakob, 2020). However, there are no formulated indicators that pupils have to achieve, but rather the interest tendencies of each pupil. The learning outcome is created based on the agreement between the facilitator, pupil, and parent at the beginning of each semester.

"At the beginning of each semester, we (pupil, parents, and facilitator) discuss to formulate the real hopes and goals of parents and pupils. Starting from what the parents expect their children to grow up like and the pupil's expectations about learning." (Facilitator 1)

The facilitator, pupil, and parents meet before the learning process starts to equate perceptions of educational goals. This agreement is essential to support the pupil's learning process because the parents will be directly involved during the learning process. It can be seen from the classroom observation that in the final week of the semester, the pupils should demonstrate their research in front of their classmates and the facilitators. By conducting a research, the pupils learn many skills holictically, also they experience the learning pocess, not receiving the knowledge transmission from their facilitators. This is in line with This is in line with the constructivism pioneered by Piaget, who expressed the idea that constructivism assumes knowledge does not merely transmit knowledge from one person to another others, but rather a process of 'construction' of experience and interaction that is developed continuously by each individual (Budiraharja, Muti'ah & Sugiarto, 2021). In demonstrating the research, they were accompanied by their parents. The researcher asked the parents about their children's research. They explained that they help their children during the research process from beginning to finish. For example, they take their children to the market to buy basic stuff. They assist their children whenever they encounter some difficulties, like when the children need help looking for buyers of their products, and the parents help them promote it among their colleagues. Parental involvement in education, according to the National PTA, leads to increased student success and confidence. Brooks (2019) explains that it is undeniable that parents who are active supporters of their children's learning provide their children with the best chance for academic achievement. Besides, Ceka & Murati (2016) also add that parents should get involved in supporting their children in doing their homework, as in this way they offer their parental support as one of the key strategis leading towards a successful education of their children at school.

On the other hand, the focus is not on the result of the pupil at the end of the semester, but SALAM prefers to see the pupil's development process during one semester. At the early childhood education level, the aspect that is encouraged and motivated is the social aspect. Then, when a feeling of comfort, safety, and trust in the environment has been built, exploration and expression are encouraged. SALAM understands that a child's natural need is to play. However, playing is directed and accompanied so the child can learn through their games. The basis of teaching here is that the child will retain the courage to explore and express themselves because that is the foundation of learning at the next level. Developing those three key aspects is different for each pupil; it depends on the pupil's condition and interest. In addition to these findings, Okoroafor et al. (2022) explain that in order to create a leader, from an early childhood, the child must be creative, able to work in a team, and able to think out of the box. Through games, the children are able to develop those important skills to shape them to become a good leader in the futures.

"The learning process at SALAM is custom because each child has different areas of interest, so let the children explore their respective areas like that." (Facilitator 2)

Besides, the facilitator is required to observe the difficulties experienced by pupils. However, the solution to the difficulties faced by these pupils is not only the responsibility of the facilitator but also the responsibility of the parents. As stated by Novianti & Garzia (2020), pupils will be able to face various challenges and changes

that occur in their life with caregiving and good mentoring from parents. Moreover, the facilitator needs to know the pupil and their parents personally to help them find a suitable solution. In this case, SALAM facilitators play the role of solution providers, where they help to provide solutions to problems and difficulties experienced by the pupils (Setyoningrum, 2020). In the pupils' report, parents' tendencies are also seen and observed during the learning process. Besides, there are important things about education for children that parents do not understand. It is the facilitator's task to change the perspective and way of thinking of parents about their children.

"We are the children's defenders because sometimes parents tend to compare their children. It cannot be because every child is different." (Facilitator 3)

Therefore, the report card is for both the pupils and their parents. The parents must read and evaluate themselves based on the pupil's report card. Comparing the kids is killing their mental development slowly but surely. Ramaiya (2022) said that comparing kids causes deep-set emotional bruises, which are difficult to heal and can result in aggression, antagonism, and resentment. Thus, evaluating the parents' behaviour is crucial to ensure that the kids grow up in a good environment. In addition, parents are a significant factor in children's education because the family environment is the first educational centre for children. Educating children cannot be entirely handed over to the facilitator by parents because the responsibility for educating children is the full responsibility of the parents. SALAM is here to present education where parents feel most responsible for the development of their children so that parents are always involved in the children's learning process. It is important to involve parents in the educational process of their children because by involving them, the outcome of the children usually can be qualified as positive and encouraging (Ceka & Murati, 2016).

Furthermore, pupils at SALAM are not required to be able to understand many things, but they must understand things that interest them and study them in depth. The facilitators at SALAM do not see the result of the pupils, but the facilitators see the needs of the pupils, their development, and the problems they face. In this way, the facilitators understand the strengths and weaknesses of their pupils and can help them develop their strengths and overcome their weaknesses.

The pupil report cards at SALAM are in the form of long and detailed narratives about the learning process, pupil development, what pupils have done for one semester, and their needs. Therefore, the pupil's report card can be in sheets, varying between one pupil and another.

"The report card is in the form of a detailed narrative. Because one child has different cases and different events, of course, the narratives are different. So sometimes there are only three sheets, there are four sheets, so the report cards are different." (Facilitator 2)

Although the pupils have different report cards, the standards are the same. Three aspects are being assessed in SALAM; they are psychomotor, cognitive, and affective aspects. However, this semester the education office asked the facilitators to make report cards according to the P5 format (Program Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila), contained in the newest curriculum, the Merdeka Curriculum, and added to the

reflections of parents. Before the government launched this program, SALAM had already done this; it just needed to be included in the report card.

Unlike conventional schools with assessment rubrics, SALAM does not have them. SALAM does not use a number or letter scale to grade pupils. Assessment using numbers or letters does not inform anything about the pupil's learning process. On the other hand, using numbers or letters to assess the pupil may be problematic for the pupils and parents. By giving pupils report cards in narrative form, the facilitators can minimize and prevent the parents from labelling or judging their kids. The facilitators at SALAM always see each pupil's positive side and explore why the pupils do every action because there must be a reason behind it. That reason is what the facilitators explore and then put in the narrative report card. By making positive side narratives, the pupil's weaknesses are explicitly seen. In short, the pupil's weakness is still raised but with a positive narrative.

#### The Difficulties in Implementing Authentic Assessment

The facilitators' difficulty in implementing authentic assessment is due to time management in dividing the role of guiding and assessing the pupils. This finding is in line with findings that inadequate allotted time is one of the major challenges in implementing authentic assessment. During the pupils' mentoring process, the facilitator is often very focused on guiding, so the attitude assessment process needs to be carried out correctly. As it is known that the facilitator has to get to know the pupils and even their parents individually, they sometimes need help to divide their time. Moreover, the facilitator feels the time constraint at the end of the semester when writing the report cards. Because the report card is a detailed narrative about pupil progress during one semester, the facilitator needs time to write it down. It takes a long time to describe and give some evaluations for both pupils and parents. Syaifuddin (2020) also found out that time limitation is one of the major obstacles faced by teachers in implementing authentic assessment.

The second difficulty is the ability to analyze. The facilitators analyze the process of the pupils in their daily guidance, then codify the pupil's processes, which roughly have cognitive, psychomotor, and affective aspects. Then from there, the facilitators can see and analyze where the pupil's tendencies because each pupil is different, so it is not uniform. Analyzing this requires critical thinking skills and the strong reasoning power of the facilitator. Besides, critical thinking skills will help the facilitator to have greater speed and accuracy in analyzing complex information (Cottrell, 2017).

### The Solution to the Difficulties in Implementing Authentic Assessment

The facilitators can solve almost all of the problems they face in applying authentic assessment. Facilitators practice paying more attention to how to manage time properly so that the implementation of the assessment can be more optimal. The facilitators also try to manage time well, especially in summarizing pupils' activities and learning processes daily in a diary. This can minimize the facilitator's work when processing it into a narrative in the report card.

To overcome difficulties in analyzing data, the facilitator looks at more data. The data is from direct interviews with pupils and parents, documentation of pupils'

work, and detailed observations of each pupil, including their personality. Therefore, the facilitator knows the pupils deeply, not only knows their names. Knowing pupils' personality help the facilitator to help and direct them to bloom their talents according to their respective personalities (Hafsoh et al., 2021).

"Kindship is the basic here so that there is no distance between students and facilitators. This gives us the opportunity to dig deeper and deeper into students' stories. We also see what kind of parents the assessment of parents is by chatting with them, it will be seen later." (Facilitator 3)

Having rich data helps the facilitator analyze the pupil's progress because rich data can provide more in-depth insights into the pupil's interests and behavior, allowing the facilitator to interpret the data's meaning and context better. On the other hand, facilitators need time to get used to analyzing their pupils. Habits that make analysis activities easier.

#### **CONCLUSION**

To conclude, the facilitators in Sanggar Anak Alam have implemented authentic assessments to assess their pupils. SALAM has a very unique yet suitable standard of assessment. The narrative form for the pupil report card allows the facilitators to give a detailed and in-depth description of the pupil's development and minimize the parents from comparing their kids. It means that the facilitators in Sanggar Anak Alam successfully implemented the authentic assessment. However, the facilitators encountered two difficulties in assessing their pupils authentically. They are (1) time constraints and (2) the ability to analyze the data. Nevertheless, facilitators can overcome these difficulties by managing their time better and also getting used to analyzing pupil data. The result of this present study hopefully can give a clear description of how to assess the pupils' cognitive, affective, and psychomotor aspects. Authentic assessment is a suitable tool to assess those three fundamental aspects.

#### **REFERENCES**

- Aliningsih, F., & Sofwan, A. (2015). English Teachers' Perceptions and Practices of Authentic Assessment. Language Circle: Journal of Language and Literature, 10(1), 19-27.
- Aziz, M. N. A., Yusoff, N. M., & Yaakob, M. F. M. (2020). Challenges in Using Authentic Assessment in 21<sup>st</sup> Century ESL Classroom. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education*, 9(3), 759-768.
- Barkhuizen, G., Benson, P., & Chik, A. (2014). Narrative Inquiry in Language Teaching and Learning Research. New York: Routledge.
- Brooks, A. (2019). Expert Discuss the Importance of Positive Parental Involvement in Education. Retrieved from https://www.rasmussen.edu/degrees/education/blog/parental-involvement-in-education/ on December 25, 2022.
- Brown, S., & Sambel, K. (2022). A Step-by-Step Guide to Designing More Authentic Assessment. Retrieved from https://lta.hw.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/GUIDE-

- NO31 A-step-by-step-guide-to-designing-more-authentic-assessments.pdf on November 28, 2022.
- Budiraharja, B. S., Muti'ah, T., & Sugiarto. (2021). Berpikir Merdeka pada Pendidikan Sanggar Anak Alam (SALAM) Yogyakarta. Jurnal Spirits, 11(2), 158-164.
- Ceka, A., & Murati, R. (2016). The Role of Parents in the Education of Children. Journal of Education and Practice, 7(5), 61-64.
- Cottrell, S. (2017). Critical Thinking Skill: Developing Effective Argument and Analysis. London: Palgrave.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research. Boston: Pearson College Division
- Fraenkel, J. R., Wallen, N. E., & Hyun, H. H. (2012). How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Gay, L. R., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. (2012). Educational Research: Competencies for Analysis and Applications. Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Hafsoh, S., Yusuf, A. M., & Afdal. (2021). Knowing Student's Personality Types in the Determination of Career Selection According to Holland's Theory. Literasi Nusantara, 1(3), 88-98. Doi: 10.21107/literasinusantara.v1n3.40116246.
- Irmayanti, S., & Wijayanti, W. (2020). Curriculum Management: A Case Study at Sanggar Anak Alam (SALAM) Yogyakarta. Advances in Social Science, Education, and Humanities Research, 511, 207-212.
- Jopp, R. (2019). A Case Study of a Technology Enhanced Learning Initiative that Support Authentic Assessment. Teaching in Higher Education. Doi: 10.1080/13562517.2019.1613637.
- Khairil, L. F., & Mokshein, S. E. (2018). 21st Century Assessment: Online Assessment. International Journal of Academic Research in Business & Social Sciences, 8(1), 660-672.
- Novianti, R., & Garzia, M. (2020). Parental Engagement in Children's Online Learning During COVID-19 Pandemic. Journal of Teaching and Learning in Elementary Education, 3(2), 117-131. Doi: 10.33578/jtlee.v3i2.7845.
- Okoroafor, N.C., et al. (2022). Early Childhood Education as an Intrument for Good Governance in Nigeria. Journal of Practical Studies in Education, 3(3), 1-6. Doi: https://doi.org/10.46809/jpse.v3i3.45.
- Ozen, S. O., & Ozen, S. (2022). An Action Research: Experiences and Practices of Designing 21st Century Assessment Activities of Elementary Teacher Candidates. Journal of Educational Technology & Online Learning, 5(1), 128-143.
- Padmanabha, C. H. (2021). Assessment for Learning, Assessment of Learning, Assessment as Learning: A Conceptual Framework. Journal on Educational Psychology, 14(4), 14-21.
- Palm, T. (2008). Performance Assessment and Authentic Assessment: A Conceptual Analysis of the Literature. Practical Assessment, Research & Evaluation, 13(4), 1-11.
- Ramaiya, H. G. (2022). Why Should Parents Stop Comparing Their Child to Others. Retrieved from https://parenting.firstcry.com/articles/why-should-parentsstop-comparing-their-child-to-others/ on December 25, 2022.

- Setyoningrum, I. A. (2020). Peran Fasilitator Sebagai Agen Pembaharu Dalam Komunitas Belajar di PKBM Sanggar Anak Alam Bantul Yogyakarta. J+Plus Unesa, 7(1), 1-14.
- Shenton, A. K., (2004). Strategies for Ensuring Trustworthiness in Qualitative Research Projects. Education for Information, 22, 63-75.
- Syaifuddin, M. (2020). Implementation of Authentic Assessment on Mathematics Teaching: Study on Junior High School Teachers. European Journal of Educational Research, 9(4), 1491-1502. Doi: https://doi.org/10.12973/eujer.9.4.1491.