

## **The Pivotal Role of Cooperative Learning Activities in Indonesian EFL Learning Contexts**

**Kristian Florensio Wijaya**

Cita Hati International School, Samarinda

Email: [kristianwijaya500@gmail.com](mailto:kristianwijaya500@gmail.com)

### **Abstract**

*To fulfill our nation's mission in breeding more proficient, autonomous, and compassionate future professionals, educationalists are commissioned to divert their old teacher-centered teaching belief into a more student-centered approach. One of the integrative 21st-century teaching approaches worthwhile to be cultivated in our ELT enterprises is cooperative learning. Previous researchers overtly theorized that cooperative learning activities promoted a higher degree of second language enjoyable learning experiences transfiguring learners to be more highly responsible, competent, socialized, and compassionate academicians. This current qualitative library study aimed to delve more profoundly into the pivotal role of cooperative learning activities in Indonesian EFL learning contexts to encourage all ELT parties to apply this relevant student-centered learning approach in their variegated classrooms. To fulfill this research objectivity, some relevant major findings yielded by 30 cooperative learning studies were critically integrated to produce more robust research results. Based on the data analysis, it was found out that Indonesian EFL learners have gradually transformed into more professional future academicians upholding life-long learning behavior. Hence, it can be phrased that cooperative learning activities are one of the supportive learning methods rewarding to be internalized in daily-based Indonesian EFL classroom vicinities.*

**Keywords:** *cooperative learning activities, EFL learning contexts, qualitative library study*

### **INTRODUCTION**

Since the globalized educational enterprises including ELT had undergone dramatic shifts in terms of cognitive, pedagogical, and working competencies, it has been a main duty for educators to intensively prepare modern academicians to readily face all probable future life complexities by exposing them to a more student-centered as well as hands-on teaching-learning experiences. Shahroom and Hussin (2018) postulate that the industrial revolution 4.0 era greatly demanded all worldwide educators to transfigure into more innovative and creative learning facilitators for their learners. In ELT enterprises, there are 5 essential modern core values that need to be possessed by learners when determining to achieve more gratifying academic along with life success namely creative thinking, critical thinking, communication skills, collaborative skills, and self-confidence. All these five values are well-calibrated with the theory of modern life skills devised by Sutarman, Sunendar, and Mulyati (2019) averring that the decent capabilities to communicate, think more creatively as well as innovatively, establish collaborative networking with all people, and exhibit a higher degree of self-confidence will potentially enable all pupils to holistically attain more fruitful life success.

The onus had been elevated more dramatically by discerning the prevalent fact that the optimal learning implementations are not merely delimited within the restricted classroom walls but also on a real-time daily basis. Meaning to say that educators are required to inculcate autonomous, resilient, and life-long learning behavior within their learners in order to progressively survive as well as thrive in their future working worlds. This argument is positively interlinked with the theory of student-centered learning baseline proposed by Alias et al., (2018) stating that educators plunging in this ever-changing age need to be more capable of entrenching long-lasting learning attitudes at the onset of teaching enterprises in order to fully arm learners with ample rewarding learning outcomes relevant with their future working circumstances. In relation to the above-explicated facts, the identical matters also necessitate Indonesian EFL teachers to transfigure into more supportive learning facilitators for their multiverse learners rather than become the preachers imparting the knowledge in one direction passively. It can also be parsed that learning by doing nowadays had gained more profound attention compared to the aforementioned teaching approach since learners will undergo more favorable second language learning dynamics leading them to obtain richer learning outcomes, particularly useful for them to be more significant figures in their future working worlds later. This explication is tightly interwoven with the Indonesian teaching-learning fact phrased by Astuti and Barratt (2018) unveiling that Indonesian EFL teachers have more tendency to promote more dominant teacher-centered activities for their learners in which they are merely asked to listen faithfully toward the explanations simultaneously degrading the precious opportunities to hone other indispensable life skills such as critical thinking, creativity, collaborative and social skills.

Anchored on those aforementioned Indonesian ELT issues, cooperative learning emerged to bring our future generations to get closer to be more competent experts imparting positive influential impacts in their future working surroundings. Cooperative learning can be defined as a solid learning group venture aiming to transform learners into more socialized, open-minded, optimistic, energized, and critical academicians who are constantly willing to discover knowledge throughout their lifetime as well as hone their targeted skills vehemently. Astuti and Lammers (2017) construe that the holistic educational values can be predominantly attained through the full activation of cooperative learning enterprises since all academicians are obliged to establish, maintain, and corroborate mutual collaborative networking with other learning members upholding unique perspectives in order to achieve the desired learning results altogether as one unity. As learners have ingrained more sound learning commitment manifested in a solid learning group, it can be predicted that their target language skills can also be fostered gradually in the long-term teaching-learning periods. Wei and Tang (2015) have confirmed a specific positive effect of cooperative learning enterprises on Chinese EFL learners since the majority of them are discovered not only increase their persistent learning endeavor while confronting with a wide array of arduous second language learning challenges but also the striking improvement of their overall target language achievements by the end of the semester. In an identical study, Chen and Goswami (2011) also unearthed that Chinese EFL learners had consistently exhibited significant target language learning achievements after participating in cooperative learning activities as they concurrently erected more positive social interdependence with all learning companions, promoted more positive interactions through group discussion, and shouldered equal learning responsibility to achieve similar learning goals.

In the light of all these well-constructed learning dynamics, it is worth noting in this line that more well-prepared, profound, and contextual cooperative learning activities are the compulsion for Indonesian EFL teachers who are attempting to transform their learners into more independent, skillful, and professional figures in their future outlooks. This emerging

matter took place since our learners will have greater chances to master 4 English language skills; listening, speaking, reading, and writing fully in the light of supportive group networking. This notion is in harmony with the prior finding of cooperative learning study conducted by Alghamdi (2014), Almuslimi (2016), as well as Wei and Tang (2015) unfolding that a substantiate number of EFL learners had successfully acquired 4 focal English language competencies; listening, speaking, reading, and writing after being exposed to cooperative learning activities continually. In a similar tone, the further utilization of cooperative learning activities also promotes more positive impacts for the further progression of EFL learners' affective aspects comprising of social, communication, and collaborative skills. As learners face a distinctive range of laborious second language learning obstacles sustainably, they are commissioned to play their new roles as proactive learning participants, supportive learning counterparts, and efficient problem-solvers in their learning groups with the purpose of collectively securing similar learning objectives. When these commendable learning behaviors had been fully entrenched within them, learners do not merely transfigure into more astute academicians but also compassionate human beings positively bringing about more striking leverages for the advancement of human civilization. These above depictions are sitting well with the cooperative learning advantages theory proposed by Jones and Palmer (2017) avowing that the holistic core values of cooperative learning activities heed more exhaustive attention to fully develop EFL learners' laudable learning behavior, persistent learning attitudes, and emphatic actions in scaffolding other developing learning community members' academic progression. Similarly, Farrell and Jacobs (2016) also articulate that EFL learners taking part in cooperative learning activities do not merely navigate their resilient learning endeavor to undergird more potent collaborative networking with other learning counterparts but also cast more attentive social supports, particularly for struggling learning companions.

However, there are some paramount rules for Indonesian EFL teachers planning to incorporate cooperative learning activities in their diverse wide-ranging classroom circumstances. First cooperative learning groups should comprise heterogeneous members possessing distinctive learning backgrounds, levels, and interests in order to enable them to disseminate the gained knowledge more openly to each other. This first regulation is in consonance with the principle of cooperative learning dynamics introduced by Slavin (2015) asserting that through diverse cooperative learning groups, EFL learners will be more able to put a higher degree of reverence to other learning members' sharing allowing more positive trajectories for the holistic knowledge or skills development collectively undergone by all learning community members. The second value that should be kept in mind by teachers is they need to rejuvenate their existent roles as supportive learning facilitators for their learners. In cooperative learning activities, it is the teachers who are responsible for arousing learners' learning interest through some encouraging, enlightening, and captivating topics that resulted in the elevation of learners' learning curiosity eventually directing them to be more proactive learning participants who are sustainably desirous of broadening their existing understanding. This contention is substantiated by the seminal theory of cooperative learning strategy postulated put forth by Gillies (2016) theorizing that EFL teachers are the front-line figures needing to guide the intensive cooperative learning discussions by continually encouraging them to select the appropriate learning issues, devise varied optional learning solutions corresponding with their learning problems, and infuse more positive cooperative learning climates wherein all learners can work more mutually with each other to resolve the targeted learning problems.

Furthermore, it is worthy of attention to also mention 5 predominant cooperative learning benefits as devised by Khuzaemah, Abdullah, and Asmawati (2014) namely the

establishment of positive social interdependence, dialogic conversational group events, equal learning responsibility, interpersonal skills nourishment, and effective collaborative networking. In the light of these 5 core values, EFL learners can potentially experience more enjoyable second language learning dynamics, display more gratifying second language learning performances, and mitigate excessive levels of second language anxiety. In accord with these advantageous EFL learning merits, Gagne and Parks (2013) uncovered that the majority of EFL learners had successfully elevated their target language competencies through more pleasurable cooperative learning enterprises. With respect to this finding, Motaei (2014) also reported that most EFL learners had dramatically improved their second language competencies after being introduced to cooperative learning activities. Lastly, Duxbury and Tsai (2010) also revealed that EFL learners had showcased more robust self-confidence while confronting a vast array of English language teaching-learning challenges through cooperative learning activities.

In relation to the above-recited notions of cooperative learning activities in relation to EFL learning contexts, this present qualitative library study was plied to overtly portray the pivotal role of cooperative learning activities in Indonesian EFL learning contexts. By garnering the prior significant research results generated by 30 cooperative learning studies conducted in our nation, the optimistic view for the future ELT advancement can be extrapolated since all of the in-depth overviews with regard to the critical importance of applying cooperative learning activities at the outset of Indonesian EFL teaching-learning activities will strongly prompt ELT experts, educationalists, practitioners, and policy-makers to embark embracing this meritorious student-centered learning approach in their diverse wide-ranging classroom settings potentially breeding more competitive, collaborative, and proficient academicians redounding apparent positive influences for their future working places. To achieve this study aim, one specific research problem was formulated namely: To what extent do cooperative learning activities promote rewarding EFL learning merits in Indonesia?

### **The Benefits of Cooperative Learning Activities in EFL Classroom Settings**

Again, it is worth reiterating here that the internalization of cooperative learning activities will potentially promote more student-centered learning enterprises where all learners feel free to interact more openly with their learning companions, disseminate a higher degree of cooperation as a solid group, and overcome the given learning issues altogether. These advantageous values can be tailored with cooperative learning merits theory propounded by Li and Lam (2013) averring that cooperative learning activities allowed EFL learners to be more open-minded, independent, and confident academicians since they are given ample precious chances to construct the knowledge collaboratively with all learning community members. Hence, to maximize all of these aforementioned learning outcomes, EFL teachers are required to bring about more positive, pleasant, and supportive cooperative learning enterprises in which all learners have committed jointly to reaching the predetermined learning objectives by deploying more open-ended sharing benefitting their knowledge as well as competencies growth. This notion seems to concur with the cooperative learning theory invented by Yaseen (2014) arguing that when EFL educators have successfully activated more student-centered teaching orientation in the light of cooperative learning activities, the probability for learners to expand their second language competencies will be higher. Another beneficial values promoted by cooperative learning activities are learners will be more capable of honing their target language skills more intensively and transfigure into more confident academicians strongly willing to widen their targeted second language competencies. These above-mentioned advantages are paralleled with the

advantageous values of cooperative learning approaches adduced by Nair and Sanai (2018) asserting that with the support of cooperative learning activities, learners will be more prompted to utilize their target language skills more confidently due to the embodiment of enjoyable learning circumstances sit alongside with their learning motivation nurturance. To a lesser extent, EFL learners' laudable learning behavior will also be seized through the implementation of cooperative learning activities since they are well-trained to address a higher degree of reverence toward other learning partners upholding distinctive learning perspectives, ideas, and preferences. As a result, they have become more empathic and compassionate academicians, particularly in assisting other struggling learning members. This perspective affirms the theory of cooperative learning strategy alluded by Mekki (2016) promulgating that the positive character reinforcement can be well-insured for all EFL learners engaging in cooperative learning activities since they are advocated to mutually assist other developing learning companions to arise no one left behind slogan into the real-time classroom vicinities.

### **Cooperative Learning Activities Increasingly Stabilize EFL Learners' Individual Accountability.**

One of the major privileged competencies EFL learners can potentially establish, preserve, and amplify in cooperative learning activities is individual accountability. This skill denotes learners' capabilities to not merely shoulder similar group learning responsibility to attain the targeted learning goals but also promulgate a wide array of meaningful sharing to others to provide more synergized learning construction for other learning counterparts to thrive. This definition hinged upon the theory of individual accountability pointed by Astuti and Lammers (2020) confirming that through the activation of individual accountability, EFL learners will share an identical learning responsibility in the form of actual learning performances, sharing, and discussions directing them to be more proficient academicians infusing consistent discipline behavior. As a corollary, each learner is demanded to display their best learning performances in their specific cooperative learning groups to continually support them in revolutionizing their targeted second language competencies in a better pathway. This view has strengthened the critical importance of individual accountability postulated by Astuti and Barratt (2021) exclaiming that it is a must for EFL educationalists to commission their learners to be more persistent academicians strongly willing to showcase their optimum learning effortful actions through cooperative learning dynamics to collectively receive identical fruitful learning success. There are vast array of cooperative learning activities valuable to be implemented by EFL teachers to invigorate their learners' accountability sustainably as proffered by Astuti and Lammers (2020) namely learners' presentation in front of the classroom, the group presentations demanded each learner to raise their opinions, exchanging ideas taking place in other learning groups, interactive presentation, and problem-based learning activities. By committing executing all these activities, more holistic, relaxing, and exhilarating EFL learning events can be revived since all learners had instilled more robust second language learning desire to synchronously be more responsible, proactive, and autonomous academicians willing to fertilize other learning community members' existent perspective toward the specific-subject matters in the guidance of open-ended as well as meaningful group sharing.

### **METHOD**

This present qualitative study utilized a document analysis method. The aim of this method is to discover some specific conceptions forming in the written texts. Thus, some

selected journal articles are indispensable parts to maintain the credibility of this study. To choose more appropriate journal articles, the researcher kept 2 specific criteria in mind. First, the prior journal articles had yielded some significant contributions for the implementations of cooperative learning activities in Indonesian EFL learning contexts. Second, all the obtained findings from previous journal articles had generated some rewarding insights for Indonesian ELT parties with regard to the effective utilization of cooperative learning activities in various EFL learning circumstances. This study specifically investigated the pivotal role of cooperative learning activities in Indonesian EFL learning contexts. Therefore, open-coding was also employed to subsume some correlated findings into similar themes. Based on the profound data analysis accomplished by the researcher, the incorporation of cooperative learning activities have brought about a higher degree of ELT continual practices in our archipelago in terms of (1) Cooperative learning activities direct Indonesian EFL learners to be more professional future academicians and (2) Enjoyable cooperative learning activities heighten Indonesian EFL learners' second language learning motivation.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

In these following lines, the researcher attempted to explicate 2 major themes inferred from the specific findings yielded by 30 cooperative learning studies namely: (1) Cooperative learning activities direct Indonesian EFL learners to be more professional future academicians and (2) Enjoyable cooperative learning activities heighten Indonesian EFL learners' second language learning motivation. To generate more trustworthy findings in this present library study, all relevant prior cooperative learning theories as well as results will be capitalized on altogether with the in-depth arguments presented by the researcher.

### Theme 1: Cooperative Learning Activities Direct Indonesian EFL Learners to be More Professional Future Academicians

Table 1: Cooperative Learning Activities Direct Indonesian EFL Learners to be More Professional Future Academicians

| Theme 1  | Authors  |
|--|--|
| Cooperative Learning Activities Direct Indonesian EFL Learners to be More Professional Future Academicians | Ghufron and Ermawati (2018); Astuti and Lammers (2017); Prastyo (2017); Sutarman and Mulyati (2019); Devi, Musthafa, and Gustine (2015); Budiarti (2019); Wahyukti (2017); Nurmila, Humaera, and Atikah (2020); Yuliasri (2017); Jacobs and Ivone (2020); Mubarak and Rudianto (2017); Hasyim (2019); Fauziyah, Meilani, and Salsabila (2021); Yanti (2020). |

One of the major positive springboards underlying the effective implementation of cooperative learning activities in varied Indonesian EFL classroom contexts is learners can transfigure into more professional future academicians. A wide range of factors significantly affects this transformative change. In cooperative learning dynamics, Indonesian EFL learners can be more responsible, well-organized, proactive, and efficient problem-solvers by

engaging in more meaning-making social interactions as well as intensive group discussions with other learning members. As a result, they have also become more confident in harnessing their target language competencies although they still inhabit developing learning progress. This first finding was well-echoed by identical cooperative research results in Astuti and Barratt (2018) together with Sunggingwati (2019) revealing that the majority of Indonesian EFL learners have been more excellent in their learning management time, effortful actions, and commitment after participating in cooperative learning activities directly resulted in more gratifying second language learning achievements. Another positive influential factor strongly determining a higher degree of professionalism beneficial for Indonesian EFL learners' life continuity in the future working worlds is the conducive cooperative learning activities atmosphere. In this case, conducive connotes learners' capabilities to establish more solid cooperation with other learning companions ingraining diverse perspectives, construct more obvious learning objectives altogether with other learning counterparts, and expend more innovative work actions while attempting to overcome various learning impediments. Concerning all of these pivotal cooperative learning ethics, Devi, Musthafa, and Gustine (2015) also theorize 3 major fundamental values potentially bringing Indonesian EFL learners to be more professional future language academicians namely positive networking infused within each group member, a higher degree of commitment to actualize their learning objectivities collectively, and out-of-the-box ideas disseminated within the particular cooperative learning groups.

The inculcation of cooperative learning activities also sustains Indonesian EFL learners' self-confidence. Since each learning group member shared similar learning accountability without exalting particular superior individuals to elude them from becoming dominant learners inhibiting other learning partners to holistically exhibit their proactive learning attitudes. This belief is mutually interlinked with the previous cooperative learning findings unfolded by Wahyukti (2017) avowing that in the light of cooperative learning enterprises, learners can magnify their self-confidence levels exceptionally due to the equal learning participations undergone by them. In another interesting cooperative learning study, Nurmila, Humaera, and Atikah (2020) also report that a substantial number of Indonesian EFL learners engaging in cooperative learning activities consistently display a higher degree of self-confidence as they are fairly allowed to raise their arguments, vigorously forge their social skills, and elevate their target language competencies in a better direction. Another essential cooperative learning advantageous merit that can be potentially inherited by our learners in their apparent lives is they have become more proficient second language academicians possessing compassionate learning behavior by supportively addressing striking learning assistances for other struggling learning members. As they have fully cast insistent mutual learning supports to others, the probability to obtain similar fruitful second language learning outcomes will be higher. Along a similar line, Jacobs and Ivone (2020) propound that the majority of Indonesian EFL learners have become more competent academicians implanting more compassionate learning behavior in cooperative learning activities since they are commissioned to be indirect teacher's assistants in scaffolding other developing learning members. Reciting about cooperative learning activities cannot be detached from the robust growth of critical thinking skills gained by learners. Therefore, it is of utmost importance for Indonesian EFL teachers not superficially enact more pleasurable but also intriguing cooperative learning activities for their learners for them to organize their thinking framework constructively, formulate various critical questions successfully, and better arrange their designated ideas accordingly. Aligning with this conviction, Mubarak and Rudianto (2017) exclaim that cooperative learning dynamics enable Indonesian EFL learners

to be more critical thinkers, innovative learning planners, and well-organized learning managers.

## **Theme 2: Enjoyable Cooperative Learning Activities Heighten Indonesian EFL Learners' Second Language Learning Motivation**

Table 2: Enjoyable Cooperative Learning Activities Heighten Indonesian EFL Learners' Second Language Learning Motivation

| Theme 2   | Authors   |
|---|---|
| Enjoyable Cooperative Learning Activities Heighten Indonesian EFL Learners' Second Language Learning Motivation | Astuti and Barratt (2018); Sunggingwati (2019); Astuti and Lammers (2017); Hengki, Jabu, and Salija (2017); Astuti and Lammers (2020); Susidamaiyanti (2018); Hidayati, Kharisma, and Satriani (2018); Harjono (2011); Yusniah and Andriana (2012); Lubis and Rahmawati (2019); Andriyono (2020); Pramusita (2019); Astuti (2016); Astuti and Barratt (2021); Susilowati (2020); Prasetyo (2018). |

It is critically important for Indonesian EFL teachers to ascertain that more favorable cooperative learning activities have been well-resided within their diverse wide-ranging classroom circumstances to continuously cultivate their learners' learning motivation to develop their target language competencies more autonomously. In simpler words, it can be restated that through enjoyable and meaningful cooperative learning dynamics, Indonesian EFL learners can potentially transform into more life-long knowledge seekers strongly determining to forger their targeted language skills both in formal classroom learning contexts and outside the classroom walls. This finding is intimately related to the previous cooperative learning findings uncovered by Hengki, Jabu, and Salija (2017) declaring that Indonesian EFL learners' 4 English language skills have been gradually increased after being exposed to more exhilarating, inspiring, and encouraging cooperative learning enterprises. This finding is consistent with another prior cooperative learning major research result discovered by Astuti and Lammers (2020) pinpointing that it is suggestive for Indonesian EFL teachers to design more motivating, energizing, and pleasurable cooperative learning ventures for learners to efficiently assist them to expedite their target language competencies' further development along with motivation. Hidayati, Kharisma, and Satriani (2018) also posit that it has been a high time for Indonesian EFL educators to render their tedious second language learning activities into more interactive and fun cooperative learning dynamics to thoroughly foster their target language skills development guiding them to attain more satisfying language learning outcomes.

As explicated in the prior section, heterogeneous cooperative learning groups should be designed at the commencement of ELT enterprises to avert EFL teachers as well as learners from fruitless second language learning activities. The demerit values that can be potentially taken by our future generations while failing to create more diverse cooperative learning clusters are free-riding group learning activities requiring one or two learners to shoulder gigantic learning responsibility, incapability to allocate equal individual

accountability among group members, and continuous conflicts occurred among learners upholding diverse opinions. All these cooperative learning backgrounds concur with the prior major finding found out by Harjono (2011). This researcher asserted that homogeneous cooperative learning groups would potentially deactivate the solid group networking hazardously causing the breakdown of meaningful cooperative learning enterprises. To overcome this harmful learning obstruction, it is worth emphasizing to depart from the prior cooperative learning result generated by Lubis and Rahmawati (2019) suggesting Indonesian EFL teachers to creating cooperative learning groups constituting of learners possessing distinctive learning backgrounds to actualize more dialogic, positive, intimate, and mutual social interactions among group members affecting their subsequent synergized cooperative works interplay to collectively achieve fruitful learning outcomes.

For the betterment of cooperative learning activities, it is worth advocating for Indonesian EFL teachers to create moderate cooperative learning dynamics which do not cast mountainous burdens for all learners, yet still stimulating them to foster their critical thinking skills, creativity, proactive learning participations, social skills, and target language competencies in a better purpose. This notion is in conjunction with the prior cooperative learning research finding discovered by Pramusita (2019) proclaiming that the greater the cooperative learning complexities, the more reluctant Indonesian EFL learners, particularly the beginner ones to exhibit their supportive learning behavior bolstering the conduciveness of those designed activities. Hence, Indonesian EFL teachers must impart more obvious cooperative learning instructions, capitalize on cooperative learning activities tightly interwoven with learners' learning proficiency, and provide enough classroom learning periods corroborating their positive cooperative learning aspects development. In line with this contention, Susilowati (2020) prompted Indonesian EFL teachers to bring about more psychological-friendly cooperative learning enterprises for their learners in terms of the specific instructions, existent learning contexts, and the availability of learning time. In conformance with this above-mentioned finding, Prasetyo (2018) also parsed that the relaxing cooperative learning activities closely matched with learners' current learning contexts will maximally diminish their higher level of second language learning anxiety reciprocally enabling them to be more persistent knowledge discoverers amid various arduous learning obstacles.

## CONCLUSION

Taken together, the critical importance of cooperative learning activities need to be ruminated more exhaustively by Indonesian EFL educationalists. Since our future generations can progressively transfigure into more professional academicians ingraining laudable personalities, affective, and psychological aspects. Anchored on this urgent matter, it is becoming crucially paramount for all Indonesian EFL experts, educators, practitioners, ad policy-makers to design more favorable, encouraging, and enlightening cooperative learning activities best suited with learners' learning levels to transform them into more competent future second language academicians readily transforming their working as well as life surroundings in a better purpose. Notwithstanding with the positive research results, some particular drawbacks should be openly repudiated for the advancement of future ELT enterprises in this nation. First, this present qualitative library study did not profoundly compare and contrast the major significance of collaborative ad cooperative learning activities resulted in research findings incongruence whether cooperative learning activities have been holistically uniformed to be incorporated in all Indonesian EFL learning vicinities. The second dearth of this study is closely correlated with the amount of literature selected for

this study. Due to the minimum number of cooperative learning studies integrated in this current study, future researchers are advised to internalize a considerable number of cooperative learning activities implementation in the ongoing Indonesian ELT enterprises for the sake of language learning outcomes enrichment significantly rewarding for our future generations' lifetime.

## REFERENCES

- Alghamdi, R. (2014). EFL Learners' Verbal Interaction during Cooperative Learning and Traditional Learning (Small Group). *Journal of Language Teaching & Research*, 5(1).
- Alias, N. S., Hussin, H., Hassan, J., Adnan, N. S. M., Othman, M. H., & Hussin, K. (2018). Perception of teacher on cooperative learning. In *MATEC Web of Conferences* (Vol. 150, p. 05068). EDP Sciences.
- Almuslimi, F. (2016). The effect of cooperative learning strategy on English reading skills of 9th grade Yemeni students and their attitudes towards the strategy. *IMPACT: International Journal of Research in Humanities, Arts and Literature*, 4(2), 41-58.
- Al-Yaseen, W. S. (2014). Cooperative learning in the EFL classroom. In *International Academic Conference Proceedings* (pp. 92-98).
- Andriyono, A. (2020). Cooperative Learning on EFL Proficiency; The Best Practice at Islamic High School Students. *Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, 8(3), 276-286.
- Astuti, P. (2016). How Individual Accountability in Cooperative Learning Helps EFL Learners Learn The Target Language. *The 5th English Language Teaching, Literature, and Translation*, 502.
- Astuti, P., & Barratt, L. (2018). Individual accountability in cooperative learning in EFL classrooms: More opportunities for peer interaction. *Journal of Asia TEFL*, 15(1), 1.
- Astuti, P., & Barratt, L. (2021). "She Taught Me Words": The Availability of Vocabulary Help in EFL Classrooms during Cooperative Learning's Peer Interaction.
- Astuti, P., & Lammers, J. C. (2017). Individual accountability in cooperative learning: More opportunities to produce spoken English. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 7(1), 215-228.
- Astuti, P., & Lammers, J. C. (2017). Making EFL instruction more CLT-oriented through individual accountability in cooperative learning. *TEFLIN Journal*, 28(2), 236-259.
- Astuti, P., & Lammers, J. C. (2020). "They Had Peer Preference": A Portrait of Tensions in Cooperative Learning Implementation in EFL Classrooms. *Journal of Asia TEFL*, 17(2), 446.
- Budiarti, L. I. (2019). The Development of Students' Self-Confidence Through Cooperative Learning (CL) in an EFL Classroom (Doctoral dissertation, UNNES).
- Chen, H. Y., & Goswami, J. S. (2011). Structuring Cooperative Learning in Teaching English Pronunciation. *English language teaching*, 4(3), 26-32.
- Devi, A. P., Musthafa, B., & Gustine, G. G. G. (2015). Using cooperative learning in teaching critical thinking in reading. *English Review: Journal of English Education*, 4(1), 1-14.
- Duxbury, J. G., & Tsai, L. L. (2010). The Effects of Cooperative Learning on Foreign Language Anxiety: A Comparative Study of Taiwanese and American Universities. *Online Submission*, 3(1), 3-18.
- Farrell, T. S., & Jacobs, G. M. (2016). Practicing What We Preach: Teacher Reflection Groups on Cooperative Learning. *Tesl-Ej*, 19(4), n4.

- Fauziyah, F., Meilani, S. G., & Salsabila, S. (2021). Cooperative Learning Strategy in Critical Reading English Text Through Team Game Tournament (TGT) and Jenga. *Jurnal JOEPALLT (Journal of English Pedagogy, Linguistics, Literature, and Teaching)*, 9(1).
- Gagné, N., & Parks, S. (2013). Cooperative learning tasks in a Grade 6 intensive ESL class: Role of scaffolding. *Language Teaching Research*, 17(2), 188-209.
- Ghufron, M. A., & Ermawati, S. (2018). The strengths and weaknesses of cooperative learning and problem-based learning in EFL writing class: Teachers' and students' perspectives. *International Journal of Instruction*, 11(4), 657-672.
- Gillies, R. M. (2016). Cooperative learning: Review of research and practice. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education (Online)*, 41(3), 39-54.
- Harjono, H. S. (2011). Is Cooperative Learning Better Than Individual Learning in Reading Comprehension Workshop? *Jurnal Tekno-pedagogi*, 1(1).
- Hasyim, F. (2019). Cooperative Learning Approach to an English Academic Reading Course. *Script Journal: Journal of Linguistics and English Teaching*, 4(2), 147-160.
- Hengki, H., Jabu, B., & Salija, K. (2017). The effectiveness of cooperative learning strategy through english village for teaching speaking skill. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 8(2), 306-312.
- Hidayati, L. A., Kharisma, I., & Satriani, I. (2018). Students' Perception in Applying Cooperative Learning in EFL Classroom. *ETERNAL (English, Teaching, Learning, and Research Journal)*, 4(1), 16-30.
- Jacobs, G. M., & Ivone, F. M. (2020). Infusing Cooperative Learning in Distance Education. *TESL-EJ*, 24(1), n1.
- Jones, B. A., & Palmer, R. (2017). Active learning in Japanese university EFL Classes: Clarifying the construct. *Hirao School of Management Review*, 7, 107-125.
- Khuzaemah, K., Abdullah, R., & Asmawati, L. (2014). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Numbered Heads Together (NHT) dan Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Terhadap Hasil Belajar. *JTPPm (Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran): Edutech and Intructional Research Journal*, 1(2).
- Li, M. P., & Lam, B. H. (2013). Cooperative learning. *The Hong Kong Institute of Education*, 1-33.
- Lubis, A. H., & Rahmawati, E. (2019). Literature-circles-based cooperative writing: From the perceptions of Indonesian university EFL learners with writing anxiety. *Journal of Asia TEFL*, 16(4), 1422.
- Mekki, T. A. (2016). Cooperative learning in the EFL classroom. In *Special issue of the international scientific conference*.
- Motaei, B. (2014). On the effect of cooperative learning on general English achievement of Kermanshah Islamic Azad University students. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 98, 1249-1254.
- Mubarak, Z. H., & Rudianto, G. (2017, October). Cooperative integrated reading and composition (CIRC) technique in writing subject of EFL context. In *Sixth International Conference on Languages and Arts (ICLA 2017)*. Atlantis Press.
- Nair, S. M., & Sanai, M. (2018). Effects of Utilizing the STAD Method (Cooperative Learning Approach) in Enhancing Students' Descriptive Writing Skills. *International Journal of Education and Practice*, 6(4), 239-252.
- Nurmila, S., Humaera, I., & Atikah, D. (2020). Students' Response towards Cooperative Learning in English Classroom. *AL LUGHAWIYAAT*, 1(1).
- Pramusita, S. M. (2019). *Cooperative Learning of English Among Very Young Learners: Intrinsic Case Study* (Master Thesis, Sanata Dharma University).

- Prasetyo, H. A. (2018). MURDER to murder the conventional teaching reading technique; A closer look at teaching reading using cooperative learning.
- Prastyo, Y. (2017). Effects of cooperative learning on student teachers' communicative competence in Indonesia. (Doctoral Dissertation).
- Shahroom, A. A., & Hussin, N. (2018). Industrial revolution 4.0 and education. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(9), 314-319.
- Sunggingwati, D. (2019). Cooperative learning in peer teaching: A case study in an EFL context. *Research Methodology In Linguistics And Education*, 8, 169.
- Susidamaiyanti, S. (2018). Reducing Students' Foreign Language Anxiety in Speaking Class Through Cooperative Learning. *Jurnal As-Salam*, 2(2), 83-91.
- Susilowati, R. (2020). Enhancing Learning Interest Of Eighth Graders At SMP N 1 Abung Semuli By The Application Of Cooperative Learning Method And Media. *Edukasi Lingua Sastra*, 18(1), 33-39.
- Sutarman, S. D., & Mulyati, Y.(2019). Investigating cooperative learning model based on interpersonal intelligence on language learners skill to write article. *International Journal of Instruction*, 12(4), 201-218.
- Sutarman, S. D., & Mulyati, Y.(2019). Investigating cooperative learning model based on interpersonal intelligence on language learners skill to write article. *International Journal of Instruction*, 12(4), 201-218.
- Wahyukti, T. (2017). Enhancing students' cooperative learning in an EFL classroom through lesson study. *Advances in Social Science, Education and humanities Research*, 109, 288-292.
- Wei, P., & Tang, Y. (2015). Cooperative learning in English class of Chinese junior high school. *Creative Education*, 6(03), 397.
- Wei, P., & Tang, Y. (2015). Cooperative learning in English class of Chinese junior high school. *Creative Education*, 6(03), 397.
- Yanti, D. (2020). Students' Perception on the Use of Cooperative Learning in EFL Learners. *Acitya: Journal of Teaching and Education*, 2(2), 182-192.
- Yuliasri, I. (2017). Cooperative Learning for Undergraduate Translation and Interpreting Classes. In *English Language and Literature International Conference (ELLiC) Proceedings* (Vol. 1, pp. 2-7).
- Yusniah, R., & Andriana, R. (2012). The Effectiveness of Cooperative Learning to Improve Students Speaking Communicative Skills at Grade VII of SMP PGRI 174 Cikupa Tangerang. *TULIP (Tulisan Ilmiah Pendidikan)*, 1(2), 82-96.